

The Hadith of the Will (wasiyya) about the Thaqalayn: The Book and the Sunnah

The Hadith of the Will (wasiyya) about the Thaqalayn: The Book and the Sunnah



Sayyid Ali al-Husayni al-Milani

al-Islam.org

Article

Authors(s):

[Sayyid Ali al-Husayni al-Milani \[1\]](#)

بسم الله الرحمن الرحيم

الحمد لله رب العالمين ، والصلوة والسلام على سيدنا محمد وآلـه الطـاهـرـين ، ولعنة الله على أعدائهم أجمعـينـ منـ الأولـينـ وـالـآخـرـينـ

In the name of Allah, the Beneficial, the Merciful

Praise and Salam upon our Master Muhammad and his purified household, and Allah's curse upon all their enemies of the firsts and the lasts.

I have put this article to investigate what has been told from Allah's Prophet (S) that he said: "I am leaving with you the *thaqalayn*: Allah's Book and my Sunnah", especially what has been said that this was said in his sermon in the Last Hajj (*Hujjatul wada'*). I ask Allah to give us *tawfiq* to verify truth and its followers, and to make our deeds for His sake only.

(1) Event's Texts and its Narrators

The Hadith (Allah's Book and my Sunnah) is only found in a few books of Hadith and Sirah:

Malik b. Anas's narration

The oldest narrator of this Hadith – as far as we know – is Malik b. Anas who died in 179 AH. In the *Muwatta'*:

وحدثني عن مالك أنه بلغه أن رسول الله صلى الله عليه [وآلـه] وسلم قال : تركت فيكم أمرين لن تضلوا ما تمسكتم بهما ، كتاب الله وسنة نبيه

..and he told me from Malik that it reached to him that Allah's Prophet (S) said: I have left with you two things you will not get astray as long as you held on to them: Allah's Book and His Prophet's Sunnah.[1](#)

Ibn Hisham's narration

Ibn Hisham who died 218 AH said in his book *al-Sirah al-Nabawiyyah* in which he reviewed Muhammad b. Ishaq's book:

خطبة الرسول صلی الله علیه وآلہ وسلم فی حجۃ الوداع ، وقد جاء فیها عنہ أنه قال : (وقد تركت فیکم ما إن
(اعتصمت به فلن تضلوا أبدا ، أمرنا بینا : كتاب الله وسنته نبیه

The Prophet's sermon in *Hujjatul wada`* , that it was transmitted from the Prophet in that *Hujjat* that he said: I have left with you what if you hold on to you would never get lost, a clear thing: Allah's Book and His Prophet's Sunnah.²

Al-Hakim's narration

Al-Hakim al-Nisaburi, who died in 405 AH, said:

حدثنا أبو بكر أحمد بن إسحاق الفقيه ، أئب العباس بن الفضل الأسقاطي ، ثنا إسماعيل بن أبي أويس . وأخبرني إسماعيل بن محمد بن الفضل الشعراي ، ثنا جدي ، ثنا ابن أبي أويس ، حدثني أبي ، عن ثور بن زيد الديلي ، عن عكرمة ، عن ابن عباس : إن رسول الله صلی الله علیه وآلہ وسلم خطب الناس فی حجۃ الوداع فقال : يئس الشیطان أن يبعد بأرضکم ، ولكنه رضي أن يطاع فيما سوی ذلك مما تھاکرون من أعمالکم

Abu Bakr Ahmad b. Ishaq al-Faqih told us Al-`Abbas b. al-Fadl al-'Asqati, and Isma`il b. Abi 'Uways . Isma`il b. Muhammad b. al-Fadl al-Sha`rani told me, my grandfather, and Ibn Abi 'Uways, my father told me, from Thawr b. Zayd al-Dili, from `Ikrimah, from Ibn `Abbas: that Allah's Prophet (S) told people in *Hujjatul wada`* : "The *shaytan* has depaired from being worshipped in your land, but he accepted to be obeyed otherwise from what you from your deeds.

فاحذروا يا أیها الناس ، إني قد تركت فیکم ما إن اعتصمت به فلن تضلوا أبدا : كتاب الله وسنته نبیه صلی الله علیه وآلہ وسلم ، إن كل مسلم أخ المسلمين ، المسلمين إخوة ، ولا يحل لأمرئ مال أخيه إلا ما أعطاه عن طيب نفس ، ولا تظلموا ، ولا ترجعوا بعدی کفارا يضرب بعضکم رقاب بعض

So beware, oh people, I have left in you what if you hold on to, you would never get lost: Allah's Book and His Prophet's Sunnah (S). Indeed, every muslim is the brother of the muslim, muslims are brothers, and (the muslim's) brother's money is not his until he gives it to him wholeheartedly, and do not be tyrants, and do not return after me infidels (*kuffar*) cutting each others' necks. "

And al-Bukhari used `Ikrimah's *ahadith* as proofs, and Muslim used Ibn Abi 'Uways as proofs, and the rest of the hadith's narrators are agreed upon. And the (ikhraj) of this hadith about the Prophet's *khutbah* is agreed on in the *Sahih*:

يا أیها الناس إني قد تركت فیکم ما لن تضلوا بعده إن اعتصمت به ، كتاب الله ، وأنتم مسؤولون عنی فيما أنتم قائلون

"Oh people, I am leaving with you what you won't get lost if you hold on to: Allah's Book, and you are responsible, so what do you say"

Mentioning the Sunnah in this *khutbah* is foreign and it needs it. (translator's comment: meaning the hadith as it is here lacks mentioning about the Sunnah).

And I found evidence from Abu Hurayrah's hadith:

أَخْبَرَنَا أَبُو بَكْرُ ابْنُ إِسْحَاقَ الْفَقِيهُ، أَنَّبِيَّ مُحَمَّدَ بْنَ عَيْسَى بْنَ السَّكْنِ الْوَاسِطِيِّ، ثَنَا دَاؤِدُ بْنُ عُمَرَ الْضَّبِيِّ، ثَنَا صَالِحُ
بْنَ مُوسَى الطَّلْحَى، عَنْ عَبْدِ الْعَزِيزِ بْنِ رَفِيعٍ، عَنْ أَبِي صَالِحٍ، عَنْ أَبِي هَرِيرَةَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ، قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ
صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ: إِنِّي تَرَكْتُ لَكُمْ شَيْئَيْنِ لَنْ تَضَلُّوا بِعْدَهُمَا: كِتَابُ اللَّهِ وَسُنْنَتِي، وَلَنْ يَتَفَرَّقَا حَتَّىٰ يَرْدَا عَلَىٰ
الْحَوْضِ

"Abu Bakr b. Ishaq al-Faqih told us, Muhammad b. `Isa b. al-Sakan al-Wasiti said, Dawud b. `Amr al-Dabbi, Salih b. Musa al-Talhi, from `Abd al-`Aziz b. Rafi` from Abu Salih from Abu Hurayrah (RA) he said: Allah's Prophet (S) said: I am leaving with you two things after which you won't get lost: Allah's Book and my Sunnah, and they won't separate until they come to me at the Pond (al-hawd).[3](#)

Al-Bayhaqi's narration

Abu Bakr Al Bayhaqi (died 458 AH) said:

أَخْبَرَنَا أَبُو عَبْدِ اللَّهِ الْحَافِظُ، أَخْبَرَنِي إِسْمَاعِيلُ بْنُ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ الْفَضْلِ الشَّعْرَانِيُّ، ثَنَا جَدِيُّ، ثَنَا ابْنُ أَبِي أُويسٍ، ثَنَا
أَبِي، عَنْ ثُورِ بْنِ زَيْدِ الدِّيلِيِّ، عَنْ عَكْرَمَةَ، عَنْ بْنِ عَبَّاسٍ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا: أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ [وَآلِهِ]
وَسَلَّمَ خَطَبَ النَّاسَ فِي حِجَّةِ الْوَدَاعِ فَقَالَ: يَا أَيُّهَا النَّاسُ، إِنِّي قَدْ تَرَكْتُ لَكُمْ مَا إِنْ اعْتَصَمْتُمْ بِهِ فَلَنْ تَضَلُّوا أَبْدًا،
كِتَابُ اللَّهِ وَسُنْنَتِي .

Abu `Abd Allah al-Hafiz told, Isma`il b. Muhammad b. al-Fadl al-Sha`rani told me, my grandfather, Ibn Abi 'Uways too, from Thawr, from `Ikrimah, from Ibn `Abbas (RA): The Messenger of Allah (S) gave a *khutbah* to the people in the farewell pilgrimage (Hajjah al-Wada`): 'O Peple, I am leaving among you, what you will need to resort to, and you will never ever go astray, it is the Book of Allah, and his Prophet's *sunnah*

أَخْبَرَنَا أَبُو الْحَسِينِ بْنَ بَشْرَانَ الْعَدْلِ بِبَغْدَادِ، أَنَّبِيَّ أَبُو أَحْمَدَ حَمْزَةَ بْنَ مُحَمَّدِ بْنَ الْعَبَّاسِ، ثَنَا عَبْدُ الْكَرِيمِ بْنَ الْهَيْثَمِ،
أَنَّبِيَّ الْعَبَّاسِ بْنَ الْهَيْثَمِ، ثَنَا صَالِحُ بْنَ مُوسَى الطَّلْحَى، عَنْ عَبْدِ الْعَزِيزِ بْنِ رَفِيعٍ، عَنْ أَبِي صَالِحٍ، عَنْ أَبِي هَرِيرَةَ -
رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ - قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ [وَآلِهِ] وَسَلَّمَ: إِنِّي قَدْ خَلَفْتُ لَكُمْ مَا لَنْ تَضَلُّوا بِعْدَهُمَا مَا
أَخْذَتُ بِهِمَا أَوْ عَلِمْتُ بِهِمَا: كِتَابُ اللَّهِ وَسُنْنَتِي، وَلَنْ يَفْتَرَقَا حَتَّىٰ يَرْدَا عَلَىٰ الْحَوْضِ

Abu al-Husayn b. Bushran the Justice in Baghdad told us, Abu Ahmad Hamzah b. Muhammad b. al-

‘Abbas said and `Abd al-Karim b. al-Haytham, al-‘Abbas b. al-Haytham said, Salih b. Musa al-Talhi, from `Abd al-‘Aziz b. Rafi` from Abu Salih from Abu Hurayrah (RA) he said: "Allah's Prophet (S) said: I am leaving with you two things after which you won't get lost as long as you follow them or apply them: Allah's Book and my Sunnah, and they won't separate until they come to me at the Pond (*hawd*).⁴

Ibn `Abd al-Barr's Narration

Ibn `Abd al-Barr al-Qurtubi (died 463 AH) transmitted it with two chains of narration:⁵

روایته الخبر بإسناده عن داود بن عمرو الضبي ، عن صالح بن موسى الطلحي ، عن عبد العزيز بن رفيع ، عن أبي صالح ، عن أبي هريرة

One of them is from Dawud b. `Amr al-Dabbi from Salih b. Musa al-Talhi, from `Abd al-‘Aziz b. Rafi` from Abu Salih from Abu Hurayrah (RA)

And that is what al-Hakim mentioned and we will talk about it (later).⁶

نا عبد الرحمن بن يحيى ، قال : نا محمد بن سعيد ، قال : نا علي بن زيد العرايضي ، قال : نا الحنيني ، عن كثير بن عبد الله بن عمرو بن عوف ، عن أبيه ، عن جده ، قال : قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه [وآلها] وسلم : تركت فيكم أربعين لن تضلوا ما إن تمسكتم بهما ، كتاب الله وسنته نبيه صلى الله عليه [وآلها] وسلم

And the other one: `Abd al-Rahman b. Yahya, Ahmad b. Sa`id, Muhammad b. Ibrahim, `Ali b. Zayd al-‘Arayidi, al-Hunayni, from Kathir b. `Abd Allah b. `Amr b. `Awf, from his father, from his grandfather, he said, the Prophet (S) said:

Al-Qaṣī `Iyad Narration

وقال عليه السلام فيما أخبرنا به القاضي أبو علي الحسين بن محمد - رحمة الله - قراءة مني عليه ، قال : أخبرنا الشيخ الإمام أبو الفضل أحمد بن أحمد الإصبهاني ، قال : أخبرنا أبو نعيم أحمد بن عبد الله الحافظ ، قال : أخبرنا عبد الله بن محمد بن جعفر ، أخبرنا بنان بن أحمد القطان ، أخبرنا عبد الله بن عمر بن أبيان ، أخبرنا شعيب بن إبراهيم ، أخبرنا سيف بن عمر ، عن أبيان بن إسحاق الأستدي ، عن الصباح بن محمد ، عن أبي حازم ، عن أبي سعيد الخدري ، قال : قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه [وآلها] وسلم : أليها الناس ، إني قد تركت فيكم الثقلين كتاب الله وسنتي

From Abi Sa`id al-Khudri said, the Messenger of Allah (S), "O People, I am leaving among you, the *thaqalayn*, the Book of Allah and My *sunnah*..."

Al-Suyuti's narration

Jalaluddin al-Suyuti (died 911 AH) mentioned it in his book *al-Jami` al-Saghir* , he said:

تركت فيكم شيئاً لن تضلوا بعدهما : كتاب الله وسنتي ، ولن يتفرقوا حتى يردا على الحوض

"I have left with you two things after which you won't get lost: Allah's Book and my Sunnah, and they won't separate until they get to the Pond (*hawd*)⁷".

And it is (narrated) from Abi Hurayrah.

Al-Muttaqi al-Hindi's narration

Al-shaykh `Ali al-Muttaqi al-Hindi (died 975 AH) said in his book *Kanzul `Ummal* , Vol 1, Part 2, on holding to the Book and the Sunnah; he mentioned it as follows:

خلفت فيكم شيئاً لن تضلوا بعدهما ، كتاب الله وسنتي ولن يتفرقوا حتى يردا على الحوض . أبو بكر الشافعي في الغيلانيات عن أبي هريرة

"875 – I have left in you two things after which you won't get lost, Allah's Book and my Sunnah, and they won't separate until they get to the *hawd*. Abu Bakr al-Shafi`i in *al-Ghaylaniyyat* from Abu Hurayrah."

تركت فيكم شيئاً لن تضلوا بعدهما ، كتاب الله وسنتي ، ولن يتفرقوا حتى يردا على الحوض

"876 – I have left in you two things after which you won't get lost, Allah's Book and my Sunnah, and they won't separate until they get to the *hawd*"

And it is (narrated) from Abu Hurayrah.

إن الشيطان قد يئس أن يعبد بأرضكم

"941- Indeed, the Shaytan has despaired to be worshipped in your land..."

And it is (narrated) from Ibn `Abbas.

يا أيها الناس ، إني تارك فيكم ما إن اعتصمتم به فلن تضلوا أبدا ، كتاب الله وسنة نبيه

"954 – Oh people, I am leaving in you what if you hold to, you won't ever get lost, Allah's Book, and His

Prophet's Sunnah."

And it is (narrated) from Ibn `Abbas."

كتاب الله وسنتي ، لن يتفرقا حتى يردا علي الحوض

"955 – Allah's Book and my Sunnah, and they won't separate until they get to the *hawd*."

Abu Nasr al-Sijzi in *Al-'Ibanah*. And he said: very strange – from Abu Hurayrah

(2) Investigating in the Khabar's (Hadith's) Chains of narration

We have mentioned the most important chains of narration in support of the narration in the people's books, but before looking into them, we have to mention some points:

1. This *khabar* (narration) is among those that Bukhari and Muslim have ignored, and did not include them in their two books known as *al-Sahihayn* and how many ﴿اٰئِی﴾ chain of narrators that the people have not taken under the excuse that the two Shaykhs have agreed on leaving !
2. It is a narration not mentioned in any of the books they recognize as *al-Sihah* (The Correct), so it is what the six *Sihah*'s scholars and others have agreed on leaving!
3. It is a narration not mentioned in any of the respected (*al-Mu'tabarah*) *Musnad* collections like *al-Musnad* of Ahmad b. Hanbal, while it has been reported from Ahmad that whatever is not in *al-Musnad* is not true!
4. More than one among the narrators of this *khabar* have plainly talked about its strangeness. Al-Hakim said: "the mentioning of holding to the Sunnah in this sermon is strange", and he has stated the correctness of the supporting chain of narrators (*sanad*) of the sermon that contains holding to the *'itrah*. Al-Sijzi said – as in *Kanz al-'Ummal* –: "very strange" (*gharib jiddan*).

Now let us look at its chains of narration (*asanid*) in the mentioned books:

Sanad of the narration in "Al-Muwatta"

The support of Malik's story in *Al-Muwatta'*, and these are three studies:

First: studying about al-Muwatta'

Kashif al-Dhunun said: "it is an old blessed book, in which he intended to gather the correct; however, he gathered what he considered correct, not according to the convention of the *ahl al-hadith*, because he considers the *marasil* (tr. Disconnected chains) and the *balaghah* (tr. reached) correct. Such in the '*al-*

*nukat al-wafiyyah*⁸

Al-Suyuti said: "Al-Khatib and others stated that *Al-Muwatta'* is considered ahead (more prioritized) of all *jawami'* books (meaning hadith-gathering books) and *masanid*." Then he said: "according to this, it is behind Al-Hakim's *Sahih*" ⁹

Also, Al-Suyuti said: "Ibn Hazm said in *Maratib al-diyanah*: I have counted what is in Malik's *Muwatta'*, and found more than 500 *musnads*, more than 300 *mursal* traditions, and more than 70 traditions that Malik himself had not worked with, and it also has weak traditions that the bulk of scholars ('ulama) have found weak." ¹⁰

Second: Malik's biography

Malik b. Anas is discredited (*maqduhun majruhun*) from different points, we briefly mention some:

(1) Being from the *khawarij*: Abu al-'Abbas al-Mubarrad said in a study of his about the Khawarij:

وكان عدّة من الفقهاء ينسبون إليهم ، منهم عكرمة مولى ابن عباس ، وكان يقال ذلك في مالك بن أنس ، ويروي الزبيريون : أن مالك بن أنس كان يذكر عثمان وعليا وطلحة والزبير فيقول : والله ما اقتتلوا إلا على الثريد الأعفر

"and a number of *fuqaha'* were being related (by others) to them (the *khawarij*), among whom is 'Ikrimah, the *mawla* (servant) of Ibn 'Abbas, and so was said about Malik b. Anas, and the Zubayriyyun tell that Malik b. Anas used to mention 'Uthman, 'Ali, Talhah, and al-Zubayr saying: By Allah, they have never fought except over broken bits of bread."¹¹

(2) Being among the *mudallisim*: Al-Khatib al-Baghdadi mentioned it in *Akhbar ba'd al-mudallisim*.¹²

(3) His meetings with the Amirs and his being silent over their doing the *munkar* (unaccepted): 'Abd Allah b. Ahmad said:

سمعت أبي يقول : كان ابن أبي ذئب ومالك يحضران عند الأمراء ، فيتكلم ابن أبي ذئب ، يأمرهم وينهاهم ومالك ساكت . قال أبي : ابن أبي ذئب خير من مالك وأفضل

"I heard my father say: Ibn Abi Dhi'b (d. 159) and Malik used to attend at the Amirs. Ibn Abi Dhi'b would talk, ordering them what they should and should not do while Malik would be silent. My father said: Ibn Abi Dhi'b is better than Malik." ¹³

(4) He used to enjoy the instruments (meaning musical). It was mentioned in Abu al-Faraj al-'Isbahani's book.¹⁴

(5) The imams have talked about him. Al-Khatib said:

"A group of contemporary knowledgable people mentioned his faults (defects)." Then he mentioned Ibn Abi Dhi'b, `Abd al-'Aziz b. al-Majishun, Ibn Abi Hazim and Muhammad b. Ishaq.[15](#)

Ibn `Abd al-Barr said:

تكلم ابن أبي ذئب في مالك بن أنس بكلام فيه جفاء وخشونة كرهت ذكره

"Ibn Abi Dhi'b spoke about Malik b. Anas with harshness and dislike what I hate to mention."[16](#)

Also, among those who spoke about him are : Ibrahim b. Sa`d, who used to make du`a against him, `Abd al-Rahman b. Zayd b. Aslam, and Ibn Abi Yahya.[17](#)

Third: looking the supporting reference (sanad) for his narration

And the mentioned hadith has no *sanad* in *Al-Muwatta'*. Al-Suyuti said in his explanation:

"Ibn `Abd al-Barr connected it from the hadith of Kathir b. `Abd Allah b. `Amr b. `Awf, from his father, from his grandfather."[18](#) We will talk about this *sanad* when studying Ibn `Abd al-Barr's narration.

Sanad of the narration in "al-Sirah" of Ibn Hisham

The narration has no *sanad* (chain of narrators) in *al-Sirah* of Ibn Hisham either; however, it contained:

"The Prophet's sermon in Hujjatul wada'. Ibn Ishaq said: and then Allah's Prophet (S) went on for his Hajj... and made the *khutbah* to the people ..."[19](#)

And Ibn Ishaq is also discredited (*maqduhun majruhun*) according to the most renowned scholars ('ulama'), for he was accused of *tadlis* , *qadr* and *shi'ism* ! And more than one of them – Sulayman al-Taymi, Yahya al-Qattan, Wahb b. Khalid, and Malik b. Anas – said (for him): "Liar".[20](#)

And if you wanted more details, review what al-Hafiz Ibn Sayyid al-Nas (died 734 AH) mentioned in the preface to his Sirah *'Uyun al-'athar* .

Sanad of the narration in "al-Mustadrak" of al-Hakim

Basically it is from Ibn `Abbas about Isma`il b. Abi 'Uways, and we see it enough talking about him. Following are some words coming from the imams of *al-jarh* and *ta'dil* (doubting and correctings) in regarding this man who is Malik's nephew and son-in-law, copying from Ibn Hajar al-`Asqalani[21](#).

Isma`il b. Abi 'Uways

Mu`awiyah b. Salih transmitted from Ibn Ma`in: "He and his father are weak." Also, "Ibn Abi 'Uways and his father steal traditions". Also, "He is mixed up, lies, and is nothing."

Al-Nasa'i said: "weak", and in another place "he is not trustworthy".

Al-Lalika'i said: "al-Nasa'i used to exaggerate talking about him that one would leave him, and maybe he has seen what others did not because all of their opinions were that he was weak."

Ibn `Adi said: He has transmitted from his uncle strange traditions which no-one follows him for.

Al-Dulabi said in *al-Du`afa'*: I heard al-Nasr b. Salamah al-Maruzi saying: Ibn Abi 'Uways is a liar; he used to talk to Malik about Ibn Wahb's issues.

Al-`Uqayli said in *al-Du`afa'*: Usama al-Zaffaf Basri, I heard Yahya b. Ma`in saying: Ibn Abi 'Uways is not equal to two *fils* (monetary sub-unit in Arab countries – equivalent to cents).

Al-Darqutni said: I do not choose him in *al-Sahih* .

Ibn Hazm in *al-Muhalla* said: "Abu al-Fath al-'Azdi said: Sayf b. Muhammad that Ibn Abi 'Uways used to insert (fabricate) traditions.

Salamah b. Shabib said: I heard Isma`il b. Abi 'Uways saying: Perhaps I used to insert the tradition for the people of Madinah whenever they disagreed amongst themselves.

Salih b. Musa al-Talhi al-Kufi

And among his narration's *sanad* (chain of narration) from Abu Hurayrah is Salih b. Musa al-Talhi al-Kufi.

Following are their imams' words we mention them copying from Ibn Hajar al-`Asqalani also [22](#)

Ibn Ma`in said: "he is nothing". He also said: "Salih and Ishaq, Musa's sons, are nothing, and their traditions are not (worth of being) documented".

Hashim b. Marthad said from Ibn Ma`in: "he is not reliable."

Al-Jawzajani said: "it is a weak to good *hadith* ."

Ibn Abi Hatim said from his father: "(he has) very weak *hadith* ; trusted people have a lot of refutes on him. I said: Is his *hadith* worth documentinga He said: I don't like his *hadith* .

Al-Bukhari said: "his *hadith* is unaccepted from Suhayl b. Abi Salih."

Al-Nasa'i said: "his *hadith* is not worth documenting; weak". He also said in another place: "He is one whose *hadith* is ignored."

Ibn `Adi said: "No one follows most of what he says, and to me, he does not lie intentionally, he is not an example (for others), he makes mistakes, and most of what he tells from his grandfathers' virtues is not followed."

Al-Tirmidhi said: "some knowledgeable people talked about him."

`Abd Allah b. Ahmad said: "I asked my father about him and he said: I do not know. As if he was not satisfied with him."

Al-`Uqayli said: "None of his traditions can be followed."

Ibn Hibban said: "He used to transmit (traditions) from the trusted narrators what does not resemble the agreed-upon traditions until the listener certifies that his story is fabricated or twisted. Using him as a proof is prohibited."

Abu Nu`aym said: "He narrates *manakir* (false/unknown things), and he is abandoned (*matruk*)"

Sanad of the narration in "al-Sunan" of al-Bayhaqi

He transmitted it with *isnad* from Ibn `Abbas and Abu Hurayrah. The first (Ibn `Abbas) contains Ibn Abi 'Uways. The second contains Salih b. Musa al-Talhi and you know about them. Anyway, we have already talked about the two *sanads* in al-Hakim's narration.

Sanad of the narration in "al-Tamhid" of Ibn `Abd al-Barr

In *al-Tamhid* by Ibn `Abd al-Barr, the narration's *sanad* contains more than one discredited (*majruh*) narrator, but it is enough to look at the biography of Kathir b. `Abd Allah – whose narration of the *hadith* reached Ibn `Abd al-Barr – as Ibn Hajar al-`Asqalani [23](#) mentioned:

Kathir b. `Abd Allah

Abu Talib told from Ahmad: his *hadith* is refuted; he is nothing.

`Abd Allah b. Ahmad said: My father would strike Kathir b. `Abd Allah's *hadith* in *al-Musnad* and did not narrate it to us from him (Kathir b. `Abd Allah).

Abu Khaythamah said: Ahmad told me: Do not narrate anything from him.

Al-Duri said relaying from Ibn Ma`in: His grandfather had friends, and his *hadith* is weak.

Murrah said: He is nothing.

Al-Darimi said the same about him.

Al-Ajurri said: Abu Dawud was asked about him and said: he is one of the liars.

Ibn Abi Hatim said: I asked Abu Zar`ah about him and he said: (his) hadith is weak.

Abu Hatim said: not strong.

Al-Nasa`i said in another place: He is not trusted.

Ibn `Adi said: Most of what he says is not followed.

Abu Nu`aym said: `Ali b. al-Madini has considered him weak.

Ibn Sa`d said: he had few traditions, to be considered weak.

Ibn Hajar said: Al-Saji has considered him weak.

Ibn `Abd al-Barr said: Weak, actually it is unanimously (agreed upon) his weakness.

These are the words regarding the *jarh* (wounding) of the man, and what Ibn `Abd al-Barr said is enough: his weakness is unanimously agreed upon. Moreover, he tells it relaying from his father, from his grandfather. Ibn Hibban said: he has told relaying from his father, from his grandfather in his *naskh* are fabrications, and it is not *halal* to mention it in the books, and do not narrate except upon the side of *ta`jjub*.

Ibn al-Sakan said: He relays from his father, from his grandfather *ahadith* in it needs investigation. (*fiha nadhr*)

Al-Hakim said: he relayed from his father, from his grandfather in it are *munakir* (falseness)

Sanad of the narration in "al-'Ilma`" of al-Qadi `Iyad

It contains many weak and discredited (narrators).

Shu`ayb b. Ibrahim

Shu`ayb b. Ibrahim the narrator of books by Sayf b. `Umar, was discredited by Ibn `Adi who said:

He is not known [24](#).

Aban b. Ishaq al-'Asadi

Regarding Aban b. Ishaq al-'Asadi al-Azdi said :

His *hadith* is to be left.[25](#)

Al-Sabah b. Muhammad al-'Ahmasi

Only Al-Tirmidhi relayed from him – once he relayed from him, from Ibn Mas`ud a tradition and found it strange. And he used to narrated fabrications from the *thiqat* (trustworthy). Al-'Uqayli said: His *hadith* is illusion, and it is raised desist.[26](#)

Sayf b. `Umar

However, the presence of Sayf b. `Umar in his *isnad* is enough – as mentions Ibn Hajar al-'Asqalani[27](#):

Ibn Ma`in said: his *hadith* is weak.

Abu Hatim said: his *hadith* is to be left.

Abu Dawud said: he is nothing.

Al-Nasa'i said : weak.

Al-Darqutni said: weak.

Ibn `Adi said : some of his *ahadith* are famous, and most of them are *munkar* and it is not to be followed.

Ibn Hibban said: he narrates fabrication from the trusted people. Alas, they said: he used to fabricate *hadith* .

Ibn Hajar said: the rest of Ibn Hibban's speech is: he was accused of *zandaqah* (irreligious, atheism, heresy)

al-Barqani said: relaying from al-Darqutni: (to be) left.

Al-Hakim said: he was accused of *zandaqah* , and he dropped in narrations.

Sanad of the narration in "al-Jami` al-Saghir " of al-Suyuti

The narration here is relayed from *al-Mustadrak* by al-Hakim and we have talked about it in detail, and we won't repeat it.

Sanad of the narration in "Kanz al-`Ummal " of al-Muttaqi al-Hindi

Al-Muttaqi al-Hindi has mentioned it relaying from al-Hakim and Abu Bakr al-Shafi'i relaying from Abu Hurayrah. And you have known the situation of a *hadith* relayed from Abu Hurayrah. He also mentioned it from al-Hakim from Ibn `Abbas, and you have known about it.

He also mentioned it from al-Bayhaqi from Ibn `Abbas, and you have known about it. He also mentioned it from *al-'Ibanah* relaying from Abu Hurayrah, and he copied from *al-'Ibanah*'s author that it is very

strange that it is mentioned from Abu Hurayrah.

(3) Contemplating in the narration's wording and its connotations

I have known that the narration with the *thaqalayn* wording and the like has no origin since there is no trace of the will about the Book and the Sunnah with the *thaqalayn* wording and the like in the *Sihah* or the *masanid*. Moreover, the narrations mentioned in some books, and mainly *al-Muwatta'* and *al-Mustadrak*, are baseless, especially what was said – in them are *shadh* (rare) – that the Prophet (S) said it in *khutbat al-wada'* (the farewell sermon).

It is most likely that the purpose of inserting this *khabar* using these words is to compare and contrast it with the *Hadith al-thaqalayn* which is agreed upon by Muslims, and whose origin is asserted from Allah's Prophet who said it in many incidents – the most famous of which is *Hujjat al-wada'* in his known sermon where he ordered the Ummah to care for *al-Kitab* (the Book) and *al-`Itrat* (the Progeny), and to obey them, and warned from disobeying them, and he stressed that the Ummah will not get lost as long as it holds to them, and that they will not separate until they come to him at the Pond (*hawd*).

This hadith, among whose narrators are: Muslim b. al-Hajjaj, Ahmad b. Hanbal, al-Tirmidhi, Abu Dawud, Ibn Majah, al-Nasa'i, al-Hakim, al-Tabari, and al-Tabarani, and hundreds of imams and huffaz (memorizers) in the different centuries relaying it from more than 30 Companions (*sahabiyy* and *sahabiyyah*) from Allah's Prophet, with so many ways that some of our grand scholars have dedicated books to gather its sources.²⁸

This hadith clearly points to the Ummah's obligation of following Ahl al-Bayt's Imams (as) in all their religious and worldly issues.

And because of the proof and the clarity of this hadith by sanad from Ahl al-Bayt, we find some fanatics trying helplessly to discredit its *sanad* or its connotation, or mutilate its wording and text. Some of them resorted to fabricating the *khabar* of the will in the Book and the Sunnah under the "*thaqalayn*" title, claiming that this will contradict the Thaqlayn Hadith whose source is agreed upon. And, *al-hamdulillah*, we have shown that the *khabar* is fabricated and crafted.

Moreover, even if we assume that the *khabr* has some origin (*aṣl*), there is no contradiction between the will in the Book and the Sunnah and the will in the Book and the `Itrah (Ahl al-Bayt) since there is no disagreement among Muslims on following the Book and the honorable Prophetic Sunnah.

However, the "Book and `Itrah" hadith specifies the obligation to learn the Sunnah from the Prophetic `Itrah and no one else, and that is what the 'ulama' and explainers of hadith understood. Hence we see al-Muttaqi al-Hindi, for example, mentioning both narrations under the title of the second part: "on holding to the Book and the Sunnah", as is apparent for whoever reviews it.

This summarizes the debate around this narration, and praise be upon Muhammad and his purified Household.

والحمد لله رب العالمين

- [1.](#) al-Muwatta' with al-Suyuti's explanation, 2/208.
- [2.](#) al-Sirah , Ibn Hisham, 4/603
- [3.](#) al-Mustadrak `ala al-Sahihayn , 1/93.
- [4.](#) al-Sunan al-kubra' , 10/114.
- [5.](#) Ibn `Abd al-Barr has two books about the traditions in al-Muwatta' and its chains of narration which were mentioned by Kashif al-Zunun, 2/1907. One of them, al-Tamhid lima fi al-Muwatta' min al-ma`ani wa al-asanid. This which we have mentioned that 32 hadith has reached us, and it is reported from a manuscript, and we are not capable of reading its full sanad.
- [6.](#) This hints to the memory of the narrator, and the binding of listening.
- [7.](#) Fayd al-Qadir – Sharh al-Jami` al-saghir , 3/240.
- [8.](#) Kashf al-Zunun , 2/1907
- [9.](#) Tadrib al-Rawi , 1/83
- [10.](#) Tanwir al-Hawalik , 1/9
- [11.](#) al-Kamil fi al-adab , 1/159
- [12.](#) al-Kifayah fi `ilm al-riwayah , 365
- [13.](#) al-`Ilal wa ma`rifat al-rijal , 1/179
- [14.](#) al-Aghani , 2/75
- [15.](#) Ta'rikh Baghdad , 10/224
- [16.](#) Jami` bayan al-`ilm , 2/157
- [17.](#) Jami` bayan al-`ilm , 2/158
- [18.](#) Tanwir al-Hawalik , 2/208
- [19.](#) al-Sirah al-Nabawiyyah ,4/603
- [20.](#) Notice his biography in rijal books (biographical dictionaries).
- [21.](#) Tahdhib al-tahdhib ,1/271
- [22.](#) Tahdhib al-tahdhib ,4/354
- [23.](#) Tahdhib al-tahdhib ,8/377
- [24.](#) Lisan al-Mizan ,3/145
- [25.](#) Tahdhib al-tahdhib ,1/81
- [26.](#) Tahdhib al-tahdhib ,4/358
- [27.](#) Tahdhib al-tahdhib ,4/259
- [28.](#) [Ed. Note: For example, see Hadith al-Thaqlayn, a study of its tawatur]

[Get PDF \[2\]](#) [Get EPUB \[3\]](#) [Get MOBI \[4\]](#)

Topic Tags:

[Hadith \[5\]](#)

[Thaqlayn \[6\]](#)

[Sunnah \[7\]](#)

Source URL:

<https://www.al-islam.org/articles/hadith-will-wasiyya-about-thaqlayn-book-and-sunnah-sayyid-ali-al-husayni-al-milani#comment-0>

Links

- [1] <https://www.al-islam.org/person/sayyid-ali-al-husayni-al-milani>
- [2] <https://www.al-islam.org/printpdf/book/export/html/17534>
- [3] <https://www.al-islam.org/printpub/book/export/html/17534>
- [4] <https://www.al-islam.org/printmobi/book/export/html/17534>
- [5] <https://www.al-islam.org/tags/hadith>
- [6] <https://www.al-islam.org/tags/thaqlayn>
- [7] <https://www.al-islam.org/tags/sunnah>