The Truth about the 'Companions'



Sayyid Ali al-Husayni al-Milani

Translated by
Jawid Akbari

Al-Islam.org

Sub Title:

A Critical Assessment of the Term 'Companion' & Hadith al-Nujum

Author(s):

Sayyid Ali al-Husayni al-Milani [3]

The present study aims to critically asses the tradition ascribed to the Holy Prophet known as Hadith al-Nujum that narrates the following:
“My Companions are like the stars; whoever among them you follow, you will be rightly guided.”

Translator(s):

Jawid Akbari [4]

Category:

Sunni & Shi’a [5]
Hadith Collections [6]

Topic Tags:

Companions [7]
Hadith al-Nujum [8]

Miscellaneous information:
The Truth about the 'Companions' A Critical Assessment of the Term 'Companion' & Hadith al-Nujum Ayatollah Sayyid Ali Husseini Milani Translated by Jawid Akbari Islamic Truths Center A Series of Ideological Researches

Featured Category:

Debates & discussions [9]
Resources for Further Research [10]
Responses to Misconceptions [11]
Shi'a beliefs explained [12]

In the Name of Allah, the Compassionate the Merciful

With the prophetic mission of Prophet Muhammad (S), the seal of the prophets, the last and the most perfect divine religion was conveyed to humanity and prophethood came to an end. The religion of Islam emerged in Mecca but after twenty three years of strenuous efforts made by the Messenger of Allah (S) and a handful of his loyal companions it spread all over the Arabian Peninsula.

The continuation of this divine mission was an important undertaking that was entrusted publicly on Dhul Hijja, the eighteenth, by Glorious Allah, to Ali (A.S.), the Commander of the Faithful and the first personality after the Holy Prophet (S) in the world of Islam.

With the proclamation of Hazrat Ali's guardianship and succession on this day, divine blessings were completed and the religion of Islam was perfected and announced as the only religion chosen by Allah. That was how unbelievers and pagans despaired of destroying and harming Islam.

Soon after the demise of the Messenger of Allah (S)], some of the companions of the Holy Prophet (S) premeditatedly deviated from the course of guidance and leadership. They closed the gate of the city of knowledge putting Muslims in perplexity and confusion. From the very beginning of their rule, they placed the truths of Islam – that were like shinning sun – behind the dark clouds of doubt and skepticism by way of putting a ban on recording prophetic narrations, spreading fabricated narrations, casting doubts and embarking on hypocritical and deceptive tactics.

Obviously, in spite of all conspiracies hatched by the enemies of Islam, the truths of Islam and noble sayings of the Messenger of Allah (S) continued to spread as they were promulgated by the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (A.S), his successors and a few of his devout companions and those truths kept flowing and manifesting themselves in one way or the other in the course of history. By explaining the truths, they did away with doubts, specious arguments, and wicked beliefs inculcated by the enemies of Islam, and made the truth clear to all.

In this respect, great scholars and men of knowledge such as Sheikh Mufid, Sayyid Murtadha, Khaja Nasir, Allamah Hilli, Qadhi Nurullah, Mir Hamid Hussain, Sayyid Sharafuddin, Allamah Amini etc. having been glittering like shining stars, since they are the ones who defended Islamic truths, explained the realities of the school of Ahl al-Bayt (A.S.) and dealt with spurious arguments using their tongues and pens.

In our era, one of the outstanding scholars and researchers who has, with his eloquent pen and expressive writing, explained the truths of the religion of Islam and astutely defended the imamate and wilayah (guardianship) of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (A.S.) is Ayatollah Sayyid Ali Husaini Milani, a great researcher.

The Islamic Truths Center is proud to take up the task of reviving the fruitful and precious works of that great researcher by reviewing, translating and publishing them in a bid to make them available to students, scientific figures and those who are in search of Islamic truths.

The book in your hand is a translation of one of his works titled "haqiqat sahaba" and which hopefully will acquaint the English readers with Islamic truths. It is expected that this humble effort will earn the pleasure of the Remnant of Allah, the Imam of Time, may Allah hasten his reappearance.

Islamic Truths Center

In the Name of Allah, the Compassionate the Merciful

All praise is due to Allah, the Lord of the worlds. May the peace and blessings of Allah be upon our Master, Muhammad, and his pure family, and may the curse of Allah be upon all of their enemies.

A controversial narration ascribed to the Holy Prophet of Islam is the Hadith of al- Nujum as per which the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his family1 has been quoted as having said:

"My Companions are like the stars; whoever among them you follow, you will be rightly guided."

The present study aims to critically asses the above tradition from three major angles:

Sunni leaders, scholars and memorizers' sayings and comments on the above hadith

Veracity of the tradition in the light of Sunni scholars of jarh and ta'dil (critiques of narrators)

Thoughts within the text, significations, denotations and conclusion of this hadith.

I pray to Allah, the Exalted, to grant me success in examining and studying this tradition from these three angles. Indeed, success is granted by Allah and He is the Guardian.

Ali Husseini Milani

1. In spite of the fact that in Sunni sources the 'greeting' (salawat) after the Holy Prophet's name is written incompletely, we, as the Prophet, peace be upon him and his family, himself recommended, have written it completely.

Literal meaning of 'Suhbah'

It is important to emphasize that the word suhbah literally means "accompany", "keep company with" or "associate with". It is said that "ashabtuhu or sahibtuhu suhbatan fa anaa sahib" [I have accompanied him, so I am a companion." The plural forms of the word 'suhbah' are sahb, ashaab and sahabah.1

Raghib Isfahani writes in his Al-Mufradat fi Gharib al-Qur'an:

In the eye of custom, only that individual is considered to be a companion who is often in the company of someone.

Based on the literal and conventional meaning of the word 'sahib' (companion), the companion of the Prophet, peace be upon him and his family, is one who associated and kept company with him irrespective of whether he is Muslim or non-Muslim; good or wicked; faithful and practicing or a hypocrite. According to Ahmad ibn Muhammad al-Fayyumi, the word principally and primarily applies to anyone who has seen the Prophet and has been in his company.2

Technical meaning of 'Sahabi'

Having elaborated on the term 'suhbah', it is now appropriate to provide the technical definition of the term 'sahabi'. Scholars of Ilm al-Usul and experts in the field of prophetic tradition agree that a person is said to be 'sahahi' only if he is Muslim but when it comes to the definition of this term, scholars specializing in the two fields have discrepant views.

Sahabi as Defined by Scholars of Ilm al-Usul

The most widespread definition of sahabi is someone who saw the Prophet, associate with him and was in his company for a long time in such a way that he followed him and learned something from him. Those who saw the Prophet (S) when invited as guests and who did not keep company of him and did not follow him either are not considered as sahaba (companions).3

Sahabi as Defined by Traditionists

Most experts in the field of hadith or prophetic tradition say that one who sees the Prophet, peace be upon him and his family, and dies a Muslim is considered to be a sahabi.4

Other experts have defined sahabi as such:

"Whoever believes in Islam and lives in the time of the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his family, is a sahabi even though he does not see him."5

Some others define sahabi as follows:

"Sahabi is someone who saw the Prophet and believed in him as well as died a Muslim even though he may have apostatized during the Prophet's life."6

Certainly, there are other definitions for the term sahabi which have been marked as rare and uncommon.7

The Status of the Companions

There are three different views among Muslims regarding the Holy Prophet's companions in terms of their being just or unjust:

All the companions are infidels

A fraction of Muslims called Kamiliyah and those who share with them the same extremist views and attitudes maintain that all the companions are infidels.8 Obviously, this viewpoint is not worth

investigation and critical assessment. There is no benefit in studying this view and the corroborating arguments as well as the refutations.

Probity of companions

This view has become popular among Sunni scholars who believe that all the companions are just, reliable, perfect and without any negative aspects in their personalities. Thus, it is not permissible to refute or disprove traditions narrated by them nor is it permissible to criticize their reports. It is as though they became inerrant and immune to all kinds of mistakes and errors as and when they met the prophet and started to accompany him.

Mazni says in this regard: "All of the companions are reliable and honest."9

Khatib Baghdadi says: "The fact that the companions (of the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his family) are just is proven and clear."10

Ibn Hazm Andulusi says: "Surely, all of the companions will abide in Paradise."11

It is pertinent to mention that people like Ibn Abd al-Barr, Ibn Athir Jazri, Ghazzali and other Sunni scholars have similar sayings about the companions.12 Moreover, some Sunni scholars like Ibn Hajar Asqalani and Ibn Abd al-Barr have claimed that this opinion is agreed upon by all scholars. 13

Obviously, statements made by many other Sunni leaders are in contravention with what some other scholars claim to be a matter of consensus among all scholars because they have ascribed this statement to most scholars, not all of them. Discussing the issue of justice in regards to the companions of the Holy Prophet (S), Ibn Hajib says:

"Most scholars are of the view that the companions of the Prophet (S) are just. Some have said that the companions are like regular people; others have said that the companions are just insofar as they have not committed seditious acts. As for those who entered sedition and took part in the disturbances, they are not considered to be just because they are corrupt. Mu'tazilites, however, have said that all the companions are just except those who fought against Ali, peace be upon him..."14

It has also been said in Jam' al-Jawami' and the commentary of the same book that most of the scholars believe in the companions of the Prophet (S) as being just and there is no need for any narration or evidence to be reported or narrated. These two books have made mention of the views of some other scholars in this connection.15

Certainly, there is a group of Sunni scholars who have explicitly stated that the companions are like all other people, some of whom are just and others are unjust. Some of the important figures in this group of people are Sa'ad al-Din Taftazani, Mazari, the annotator of Al-Burhan, Ibn Imad Hanbali and other renowned figures like Showkani, the Chief Judge, Sheikh Mahmood Abu Rayyah, Sheikh Muhammad

Abdu, Sayyid Muhammad bin Aqil Alawi, Sayyid Muhammad Rashid Reza the writer of Al-Manar fi Tafsir al-Qur'an, Sheikh Muqbili, the writer of Al-Ilm al-Shamikh and Sheikh Mustafa, the writer of E'jaz al-Qur'an. 16

Obviously, this opinion is in accordance with the opinion of Imamiyah Shia. The Shiite scholars also maintain that some of the companions of the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his family, are just and some are hypocrites and unjust as shall be explained below.

What is the Shia view about the companions of the Prophet (S)?

I shall now discuss the Shia view on the companions of the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his family. As mentioned briefly earlier, Shia scholars unanimously agree that the companions of the Prophet (S) are regular people acting and behaving in the same way as the rest of the people.

Thus, there are just, hypocrite, faithful, honest, corrupt and mischievous people amongst them. Being in the company of the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his family, does not make a person infallible or immune to errors and abominable deeds, though one should be proud of being in his company.

Indeed, there are many verses in the Quran which speak of hypocrite companions, those who with their words, conducts and behavior tormented the Prophet (S) and caused him a great deal of pain and inconvenience.

There are also a lot of traditions from the Holy Prophet (S) which clearly indicate that the Prophet (S) reprimanded and scorned some of the companions. The hadith and history books are replete with reports about the companions quarrelling with each other, rejecting and speaking ill of each other.

The great scholars of hadith and their followers have made a lot of remarks and comments about the companions which have been recorded in biographical and historical sources. Instances of those comments follow as under:

Malik bin Anas was asked: "Two different traditions are reported from the Holy Prophet (S) by two reliable narrators. In your opinion, which of those traditions can we act upon?"

Malik answered: "No, by God, you cannot act upon any one of them unless he makes sure which one is true, and only one of them is true. Can two differing statements be true? Only one of those traditions is true."17

As well, elsewhere Anas bin Malik was asked about the companions having different views and he answered that only one of them was right and that precaution had to be exercised in that respect. 18

There is another report which says that Abu Hanifa said about the companions as such: "All the companions are just except a few specific individuals."

Thereupon he named some of those people who could not be trusted including Abu Hurairah and Anas bin Malik.19

Shafi'ei has been reported to have said to Rabi': "The testimony of four companions is not acceptable. They are Mu'awiyah, Amr bin Aas, Mughairah and Ziyad."20

Shu'bah says in this regard: "Abu Hurairah always practiced tadlis1".21

Laith has also been reported to have said: "Whenever we encounter a situation where we see that companions have different views, we adopt that view which is more precautious."22

Indeed, it is due, mainly, to these sayings that Imamiyah Shia continues to have such a standpoint. However, most Sunni scholars are of the view that God, the Glorified, and His Prophet (S) purified the companions and made them just ('adil).

Hence, it is necessary to walk in their footsteps and should, thus, interpret their statements which are in contravention with the Quran and tradition in a way such that they do not contradict. In a bid to substantiate their argument, they make references to verses from the Quran and traditions from their own sources. In fact, the most famous tradition which they have narrated in this regard is the alleged prophetic tradition which says:

“My Companions are like the stars; whoever among them you follow, you will be rightly guided.”

As mentioned earlier, this study will examine and criticize the above tradition with reliance on Sunni sources and on the views of their scholars, narrators and memorizers.

1. Al-Qamus al-Muhit, 1/237, term "sahb". Ibn Athir and others say: A subject noun is not pluralized in the form of fa'alah except this term. Al-Nehayah, 3/11.
2. Al-Misbah al-Munir, 1/333 under the term "sahb".
3. Meqyas al-Hidayah, 3/296; Al-Darajat al-Rafi'ah, 10.
4. See al-Mukhtasar, 2/67; Meqyas al-Hidayah, 3/300.
5. Meqyas al-Hidayah, 3/298.
6. Shahid al-Thani, Al-Re'ayah le-haal al-Bedyah, 161; Sayyid Ali Khan Madani, Al-Darajat al-Rafi'ah, 9; Ibn Hajar Asqalani, al-Isabah, 1/ 158. Also, our master, the great scholar Mamqani, may Allah bless him, have ascribed this definition in Meqyas al-Hidayah, 3/300 and Ibn Hajar Asqalani in another example, volume 1, page 159 of Al-Isabah to researchers.
7. Meqyas al-Hidayah, 3/297 – 299.
8. Al-Lubaba fi Tahdhib al-Ansab, 3/78. This view has also been reported by Sayyid Abdul Hussein in Ajwebat al-Masail, Jarullah, 15.
9. We will elaborate on Mazni's statement in future.
10. Al-Kifayah fi Ilm al-Riwayah, 46-49. This statement has been reported from him by Ibn Hajar Asqalani in Al-Isabah, 1/162 and 163.
11. Al-Isabah, 1/163
12. Al-Isti'ab, 1/117, 118 and 129, Usd al-Ghabah, 1/110; Ihya Uloom al-Din, 1/93 and 115
13. Al-Isabah, 1/162; Al-Isti'ab, 1/12
14. Al-Mukhtasar, 2/67. The same has been stated in Exposition of Al-Mukhtasar.
15. Al-Nasaih al-Kafiyah, 166.

16. Sharh al-Maqasid, 5/ 310 and 311; al-Isabah, 1/ 163; Al-Nasaih al-Kafiyah, 167 and 168, Irshad al- Fohul, 158; Sheikh al-Muzairah Abu Hurairah, 101; Adhwa Ala al-Sunnah al-Muhammadiyah, 322 and 339.
17. Al-Ihkaam fi Usool al-Ahkaam, 6/814.
18. Jami' Bayan al-Ilm wa Fazlehi, 2/905
19. Sharh Nahju Balaghah by Ibn Abil Hadid, 4/68.
20. Al-Mukhtasar fi Akhbar al-Bashar, 1/186.
21. Tadlis (concealing) refers to an isnad where a reporter has concealed the identity of his shaikh. Tadlis al- Isnad: A person reports from his shaikh whom he met, what he did not hear from him, or from a contemporary of his whom he did not meet, in such a way as to create the impression that he heard the hadith in person. A mudallis (one who practices tadlis) here usually uses the mode ("on the authority of") or ("he said") to conceal the truth about the isnad.
22. Al-Bedayah wa al-Nehayah, 8/117.

Clear Words

The fact is that a great many Sunni scholars and experts in hadith, exegesis, and biography (rijal) have clearly and explicitly considered Hadith of al-Nujum and its entire text and chains of transmission to be poor so much that it leaves no doubt as to the fact that it is unreliable and inauthentic. Some Sunni scholars' sayings regarding the said tradition will be mentioned below along with a brief account of their lives.1

Ahmad bin Hanbal Sheibani: a glimpse of his life

Ahmad bin Hanbal Sheybani, born in 241, does not consider Hadith of al-Nujum as authentic and valid. This opinion has been narrated by a group of scholars including Ibn Amir al-Haj in Al-Taqrir al-Tahbir fi Sharh al-Tahrir, Ibn Qudamah in al-Muntakhab and Amir Padshah

Hanafi in Al-Taysir fi Sharh al-Tahrir.2

All biographical books have somehow dealt with Ahmad bin Hanbal's life. Commenting on him, Zahabi says: Ahmad bin Hanbal was Shaykh al-Islam3 and master of Muslims in his era. He was a memorizer (hafiz) and authority for Muslims.

Ali bin Madini says about him: "Verily, God endorsed this religion through Abu Bakr and in the days of tribulation through Ahmad bin Hanbal. It was at a time when Arab clans had apostatized after the Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him and his family."

Commenting on Ahmad bin Hanbal, Abu Ubaidah also says, "Knowledge ended up in four people the most learned of whom was Ahmad bin Hanbal."

Quoting Ibn Ayyash about Ahmad bin Hanbal, Ibn Mu'een says: "The clerics wanted me to become like Ahmad bin Hanbal but I could not become like him."

Hamam Sakooni has also made a remark about him; he says: "Ahmad bin Hanbal has not seen the like of himself."

Muhammad bin Hammad Tehrani says: "I heard Aba Thawr say: Ahmad bin Hanbal is more learned and more knowledgeable than Thawri."4

Abu Ibrahim Mazna: a glimpse of his life

Abu Ibrahim Mazna is another scholar who believes that Hadith of al-Nujum is not authentic. Abu Ibrahim Mazna is Shafi'ei's student and companion. He was born in the year 264 A.H. Hafiz Ibn Abd al-Barr quotes him as such: "Mazna says about Hadith of al-Nujum, the alleged prophetic tradition:

"If this hadith were true, then that means that whatever the companions have narrated from the Holy Prophet (S) and evidences they present can be trusted. Therefore, based on the tradition in question, all the companions are reliable and they quote the Prophet (S) honestly.

That is what I believe is the meaning of the Hadith. However, if what the companions have uttered were acceptable to them, they would not contradict or falsify one another. None of them would turn to another companion to seek his advice. So, think over it."5

What is useful for our discussion is the sentence "If this hadith were true..." but the connotation he has drawn out of Hadth al-Nujum should be judged by hadith experts.6

Now, we shall have a short glimpse of Abu Ibrahim Mazna's life keeping in view that all the biographers have praised him for his reliability.7

Yafi'ei writes about him: Imam Abu Ibrahim Ismail bin Yahya Mazna was Shafi'ei, a pious jurist, and a profound thinker, a precise debater who tutored and trained many students.

Commenting on him, Shafi'ei says: "Manza is a helper of my religion."

He is the leader of Shafi'eites and most acquainted with the Shafi'ei methods and verdicts and whatever is narrated from him. He has written many books and was most pious and God-fearing who were learned and mediocre in knowledge and of little knowledge?! Silsilat al-Ahadith al-Dha'eifa wa al-Mawdhu'ah, 1/82.

Abu Bakr Bazzaz: a glimpse of his life

Hafiz Abu Bakr Bazzaz has also criticized Hadith of al-Nujum and elaborated on various dimension of the hadith finally considering it as poor and unreliable. Hafiz Ibn Abd al-Barr writes:

Muhammad bin Ibrahim bin Saeid narrated to me that Muhammad bin Ahmed had reported that Muhammad bin Abyyub had said: "Abu Bakr Ahmed bin Amr bin Abdul Khaliq says: "He is asked about

the traditions on the tongue of people ascribed to the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his family, and it is said by people that he said:

"Verily, the like of my companions is that of the starts – or my companions are like stars – whomever you follow, you will rightly guided."

This saying has not been correctly reported from the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his family. This tradition has been narrated by Abdur Rahim bin Zayd Ammi, from his father, from Saeid bin Musayib, from Ibn Umar, from the Prophet (S).

In some versions of the report, Abdur Rahim has reported from his father, from Ibn Amr omitting Saeid bin Musayyib. Moreover, this hadith is weak because the scholars of hadith have refrained to quote him or narrate any traditions from him.

On the other hand, this saying narrated from the Prophet (S) is unknown and does not seem to be from him because it has been reported from the Prophet (S), with a reliable chain of transmission that he said:

"Adhere to my sunnah and the sunnah of the rightly-guided successors after me. Hold on to it and cling on to it stubbornly."

If Abdur Rahim's tradition is proved to be true, this hadith will be in contravention with that hadith. If it is not proved to be true and authentic, there will be no contravention.

Moreover, the Prophet of Islam, peace be upon him and his family, does not allow Musims to have differences after him and God knows best.8

As for this saying of Bazzaz, it suffers from many setbacks and the foregoing tradition, "Adhere to my sunnah and the sunnah of the rightly-guided successors after me. Hold on to it and cling on to it stubbornly," has been discussed in a separate article.9

Having mentioned Abu Bakr Bazzaz's viewpoint, we shall now have a glimpse of his life. Abu Bakr Bazzaz was born in the year 292 A.H. Biographers have commented on him. Zahabi writes in Tazkerat al-Huffaz: Allamah Abu Bakr Ahmad bin Amr bin Abdul Khaliq Basri is the writer of Musnad Kabir and Kitab Mu'allah.

He has heard traditions from people like Hudbah bin Khaled, Abdul A'laa bin Hammad, Hasan bin Ali bin Rashed, Abdullah bin Mu'awiyah Jamhi, Muhammad bin Yahya bin Fayyadh Zamani and people of the same ranks with them. Narrators such as Abdul Baqir bin Qani', Muhammad bin Abbas Najih, Abu Bakr Khatla, Abdullah bin Hasan, Abu Al- Shaykh and many others have reported traditions from him.

He migrated to cities like Isfahan, Syria and other regions to spread his knowledge and wisdom. Daru Qutni has recorded his biography and praised him as such: "Bazzaz is a reliable person who sometimes errs and he is someone who relies on his memory."10

Ibn Adi: a glimpse of his life

Another Sunni scholar who has reported Hadith of al-Nujum in his book is Abu Ahmad Abdullah bin Adi, better known as Ibn Qattan. In his al-Kamil – which has been written about poor and reprimanded narrators as well as bout fabricated traditions – Ibn Qattan deals with the life of Ja'far bin Abdul Wahid Hashemi Qadhi and Hamza Nasibi.

Now we shall take a brief look at Ibn Adi's life. Different scholars have praised him and commented on him. Sam'ani writes the following about him:

"Hafiz Abu Ahmad Abdullah bin Ali bin Muhammad Gorgani, better known as Ibn Qattan, is the great memorizer of his time. He moved to Alexandria and Samarqand as well as entered many other cities and studied with many teachers. He was a strong and unmatched memorizer. Hamzah bin Yusuf Sahmi says that he asked Daru Qutni to write a book on weak and unreliable narrators and he asked me in return if I did not have Ibn Adi's book.

I said that I did.

He said: "That book is enough and nothing is added to it." Ibn Adi died in the year 365 of the Islamic calendar.[11]

Abul Hasan Daru Qutni: a glimpse of his life

One of the scholars who have considered Hadth al-Nujum to be weak and unreliable is Daru Qutni (d. 385 A.H). Ibn Hajar Asqalani says: He has pointed out this tradition in Malik's Gharaib considering the tradition as weak.[12] A text of what he has said will follow.

Biographers have looked upon him with high regard. Ibn Kathir writes in this regard:

The great memorizer, Ali bin Umar bin Ahmad bin Mahdi bin Masud bin Dinar bin Abdullah Daru Qutni was an expert in criticism of narrators from his time as of this era. He had seen many narrators. He was a skilled writer, critique and a leader of his time in the science of biography (rijal) and criticism of narrators (jarh and ta'dil). He has authored and composed a valuable book in this regard. He had extensive knowledge of traditions and complete information of Ilm al-Dirayah (science of the text of Hadith).

His book is the best and most famous book in this regard. He has excelled his predecessors and his followers will not be able to write a book like him unless they seek assistance from the sea of his knowledge and act like him.

He has authored another book titled Al-Ilal in which he has precisely elaborated on hadith- related points and expressions. Another book authored by him is al-Ifrad which none is able to understand

unless he is a good memorizer and critique and profound thinker.

Daru Qutni used to be described as having a strong memory, keen-mind and profound knowledge. Hakim Neishabouri writes about him: "The like of Daru Qutni has never been seen."

Ibn Jawzi says: Daru Qutni had combined merits and knowledge of many fields including knowledge of hadith, recitation, syntax, jurisprudence and poetry. He was just and correct in his beliefs.

Daru Qutni was asked if he had met anyone like himself and he answered: "When it comes to a specific field, I have seen people superior to me but I have not seen anyone to have knowledge of different skills and sciences as I do."

Ibn Hazm Andalusi: a glimpse of his life

One of the Sunni scholars who have expressly rejected Hadith of al-Nujum and asserted its invalidity is Ibn Hazm Andulusi (d. 456 A.H.). As reported by a number of Sunni scholars, he has stated in clear terms that this hadith is fabricated. For instance, while narrating this tradition, Ibn Hayyan says: "Abu Muhammad Ali bin Ahmad bin Hazm writes in a treatise in criticism of ra'y (lit. Opinion)13 analogy, istihsan (lit. preference), ta'lil and taqlid: "This false report is fabricated and forged; it is never authentic."14

Biographers have written about Ibn Hazm Andalusi's life. Ibn Hajar Asqalani writes about him: "He is a jurist, memorizer, literalist15 and prolific writer. Indeed, he had a strong memory as he had memorized numerous traditions but since he relied too much on his memory, he was careless in his utterances and speech especially when he was talking for and against narrators or when he was making mention of their names, thus creating a very bad impression of himself."

Saa'ed bin Ahmad Rab'ei says: "Amongst the Andalusids, Ibn Hazm had more knowledge of various branches of sciences as compared to others. Besides, he was acquainted with figurative science (bayan), eloquence and genealogy."

Humaidi describes him as such: "He was a memorizer and had the ability to derive and deduce Islamic laws from the Quran and tradition. He was an expert of and adherent to different branches of science. I have not seen a clever and sharp-minded man, a fast memorizer, a pious and dignified man like him."

An Andalusid historiographer, Abu Marwan bin Hebban, have also commented on him describing him as such: "Ibn Hazm was an expert in hadith, jurisprudence, genealogy and literature. Additionally, he also had knowledge of old sciences. There is no doubt that he was not free of mistakes in acquiring those skills but he had sought all those skills with courage and confidence."16

There are accounts and reports about Ibn Hazm's life in other Sunni books also.17

Ahmad bin al-Hussein Bayhaqi: a glimpse of his life

One of the Sunni scholars who have criticized the soundness Hadith of al-Nujum and described it as poor and unreliable is Abu Bakr, Ahmad bin Hussein Bayhaqi (d. 457). Ibn Hajar al- Asqalani has said that in his Al-Madkhal, Bayhaqi has considered Hadith of al-Nujum to be poor and inauthentic.[18]

Sunni scholars' books in Ilm Rijal (biography of narrators) are replete with praises and recommendations about Bayhaqi. Ibn Taghari Bardi says: Ahmad bin Hussein bin Abdullah Hafiz Abu Bakr Bayhaqi was born in the year 384 after Hegira. He was the leading figure of his time in the science of hadith and jurisprudence. He authored many books and compiled Imam

Shafi'ei's works in ten volumes. He died in the month of Jamadi al-Thani in Neishabour.[19]

Ibn Abd al-Barr: a glimpse of his life

Another renowned Sunni scholar who has studied and criticized Hadith of al-Nujum is Abu Umar ibn Abd al-Barr (d. 463). He writes:

Abu Shahab Hannat narrates from Jazri from Naafi' that Ibn Umar said: The Messenger of Allah said:

Verily, my companions are like stars. Whoever's saying you act upon, you will be guided aright.

This isnad or chain of transmission is not authentic because no one reports any tradition from Nafi' to be used for argument. This hadith has been narrated by Bazzaz with another chain of transmission: Ahmad bin Umar narrates from Abd bin Rooh, from Salam bin Sulaym, from Harith bin Ghusayn, from A'mash, from Abu Sufyan that Jabir said: The Messenger of Allah (S) said:

"My Companions are like the stars; whoever among them you follow, you will be rightly guided."

Abu Umar says: "There is no evidence to indicate that this chain of transmission is authentic because Harith bin Ghusayn is an anonymous and unknown individual."[20]

With that said, we shall now take a look at Ibn Abd al-Barr's life. Biographers have studied his life and commented on him. Zahabi is one of the Sunni scholars who writes about him as such: He was the imam, memorizer and Shaykh al-Islam of Tunisia (Maghrib).

He was born in Rabi' al-Thani 368 A.H. During his teenage period, he engaged in acquiring knowledge of hadith. Indeed, he was the chief of his time in terms of memorizing traditions, precision and profundity.

Abu Walid Baji says: "In Andalusia, no one was as learned as Abu Umar in the science of hadith."

Ibn Hazm says: "Al-Tamhid is a book authored by my friend Abu Umar. I know no one as strong and capable in theology, jurisprudence and hadith as he let alone being superior to him."

Ibn Sakrah also has commented on him as such: I heard Abu Walid Baji say: "Abu Umar is a person best known for his memorization in Tunisia."

Humaidi has also commented on him. He says: Abu Umar is a jurisprudent, memorizer, kathir al-hadith (i.e. one who narrates a lot of traditions), expert in readings and discrepancy of the Quran, in the sciences of hadith and biography. He lived with ilm al-hadith and was inclined jurisprudentially towards Imam Shafi'ei.21

Ali bin Hasan ibn Asaker: a glimpse of his life

Another renowned Sunni scholar who has considered Hadith of al-Nujum to be weak and inauthentic is Abul Qasim ibn Asaker. The text of his statement will be mentioned together with Mannwi's comment. Some biographers have praised and commended him. Yafi'ei describes him as such:

Abul Qasim Ali bin Hasan Hebatullah bin Asaker was a jurisprudent, imam (leader), outstanding traditionist, profound memorizer, precise, having extensive knowledge, Shaykh al-Islam, muhaddith (narrator) of sham (Levant), helper of prophetic tradition, eliminator of innovations, pride of memorizers, sea of knowledge, head of traditionists, capable mystic, reliable in religion, known during his time as a person of high status with none being like him amongst his contemporaries.

He possessed both intelligible and textual knowledge and distinguished authentic from inauthentic traditions. He was one of the great scholars of his time. He was considered a prominent Shafi'ei jurisprudent. He had made advancements in the science of traditions and was known for his progress in this field. He was an honest memorizer who gathered both texts and chains of transmission...22

Ibn Jawzi: a glimpse of his life

Another prominent Sunni scholar who has discredited Hadith of al-Nujum and denied its soundness is Ibn Jawzi. In his Al-Ilal al-Mutanahiyah, he writes:

Nu'aym bin Hammad is quoted as saying: Abdur Rahim bin Zayd al-Ammi related to us from Saeid bin Musayyib from Umar bin al-Khattab that the Apostle of Allah (S) has said: "I asked my Lord about what my companions would differ in after me. Then, He revealed to me:

"O Muhammad! To Me your companions are like stars in the sky, some of them are brighter than others; so, to Me, whoever takes hold of any of the things they differ about would be rightly guided."

And he goes on to add:

The soundness of this tradition is uncertain on the side of two transmitters, hence unreliable; one is Nu'aym bin Hammad who is discredited and disapproved, and the other is 'Abdur Rahim bin Zayd al-Ammi about whom Yahya bin Mu'een has said: "'Abdur Rahim is a liar".23

It should be noted that historians have given Ibn Jawzi's biography with praise and admiration. Ibn Khalakan says in his admiration as such:

Abul Faraj Abdur Rahman bin Abul Hasan Ali bin Muhamamd bin Ali bin Ubaiduallah bin Abdullah bin Hammadi bin Ahmad bin Muhammad bin Ja'far Jawzi is one of the Hanbali jurisprudents. He was a sermonizer who was given the epithet Jamaluddin, the great memorizer. He was the most learned scholar of his time, the leader of his age in hadith, oratory skill and in giving sermons. He has written books on different arts and skills.24 He died in the year 597 A.H.

Ibn Dihya: a glimpse of his life

Ibn Dihya (d. 633 A.H) has also discredited hadith of al-Nujum and denied its soundness. His very words as quoted by Zayn Iraqi in this respect are as follows:

Ibn Dahiyya has said: "I have related the hadith (My companions are like stars); this hadith is not sound."25

Biographers have reported his biography with respect and admiration. In his Husn al- Muhadherah, Jalaluddin Suyuti writes about him: Al-Imam al-Allama, the great memorizer, was insightful on hadith, and attached great importance to that knowledge. He had knowledge of etymology and Arabic literature. He has authored works in this regard. He lived in Egypt and undertook training the prince as well as teaching in Kamiliyah School.26

Abu Hayyan al-Andalusi

Another scholar and great memorizer who has discredited Hadith of al-Nujum is Abu Hayyan Andalusi (d. 745). He has an interesting research about the Hadith of al-Nujum which we will partly quote here because of its usefulness. First, he relates the following from al- Zamakhshari:

Al-Zamakhshari said: If you ask how the Qur'an elucidates everything, I would say it means that the Qur'an has explicated everything of religious affairs; it has asserted some of them and has referred some to sunna since He (Allah) has commanded to follow the Apostle of Allah (S) and obey him, and has said:

"Nor does he speak out of [***his own***] ***desire."***27

Moreover, He has encouraged Muslims to follow what has been unanimously agreed. He says:

"And follows other than the way of the believers."28

The Apostle of Allah (S) has permitted his umma to follow his companions and emulate his deeds as he said: "My companions are like stars, whomever among them you follow, you will be guided". The fact, this hadith is not uttered by the Apostle of Allah (S) and this fabricated hadith is by no means true to be

from the Apostle of Allah (S).

He states that Hafiz Abu Muhammad bin Ahmad bin Hazm has also said in his treatise in refutation of al-Ra'y wa al-Qiyas, Ta'lil and Taqlid:

This [i.e., the Hadith of al-Nujum] is a tradition which is a fabricated lie against the Prophet (S) and it can never have been said by the Prophet (S).

Bazzaz, the author of Musnad, has mentioned the chain of transmission. He says: The people narrate from the Prophet (S.) as saying: "My companions are comparable to the stars – or are like stars –, whomever among them you follow, you will be guided". This saying does not belong to the Prophet (S).

Abdur Rahim bin Zayd al-Ammi has related on the authority of his father from Saeid bin Musayyib from Ibn Umar from the Prophet (S). The weakness of this hadith is on the side of Abd al-Rahim, as the scholars have avoided transmitting his hadith.

It is to be said that the popular biographer, Ibn Mu'een, has commented in his Al- Mawdhu'at about Abdur Rahim bin Zayd al-Ammi, one of the transmitters in the chain of the transmission of the above hadith, as follows: "Abdur Rahim bin Zayd is a liar and untrustworthy." Similarly, Bukhari has said in his Al-Dhu'afa: "He [i.e., 'Abdur Rahim] is abandoned".

Hamza al-Jazri has also narrated the same tradition. Hamza's narration is disreputable and abandoned.29

A Look at Abu Hayyan Andalusi's Life

Now we shall look at Abu Hayyan Andalusi's life who died in the year 745 A.H. He has been praised by biographers. Ibn Imad said about him: "Al-Imam Athir al-Din Abu Hayyan, the renowned grammarian of his time and a philologist, interpreter, and traditionist, expert in syntax, reciter, historiographer etc. He became well-known and was known everywhere. Many great scholars acquired knowledge from him and achieved progress during his lifetime.

Safdi praises him as such: Amongst my teachers, I have never seen anyone more preoccupied and busier than him because I have always seen him glorifying Allah, writing and studying. He was precise and exact in narrating and recording traditions. He had a good command of etymology. He was the leading and peerless figure in syntax and deflections. He had spent most of his time acquiring these two skills. He had a lot of experience and knowledge in the field of exegesis, hadith, lives and biographies of people especially those of the people of the Maghrib (Morocco and Tunisia).

Kamaluddin Odfoi says: Abu Hayyan was a precise and honest authority with a sound belief.30

Shams al-Din Zahabi: a short glimpse of his lifeShams al-Din Zahabi: a short glimpse of his life

Shams al-Din Zahabi (d. 748 A.H.) has in numerous cases discredited the Hadith of al- Nujum in his Mizan al-I'tidal fi Naqd al-Rijal. For instance, in a biography of Ja'far bin Abd al-Wahid Hashimi al-Qadhi, after quoting the scholars' sayings about him, he adds:

Among his evils is his narration on the authority of Wahab bin Jarir from his father from A'mash from Abu Salih from Abu Huraira, from the Prophet (S) that he said:

"My companions are like stars, whoever follows anything from them, he will be guided."31

In another instance, writing the biography of Zayd al-Ammi, and after relating the hadith, he said: "This hadith is invalid."32

Now we shall take a short look at Zahabi's life. All books of biography have admired and praised him. Ibn Taghri Burdi said about him: "Al-Shaykh, al-Imam, the memorizer, the historian, and the author of fruitful writings, Shams al-Din Abu Abdullah Zahabi Shafi'ei is one of famous memorizers."

He had heard a lot of traditions and travelled to many cities. He was a writer, author, compiler and historiographer. He checked and corrected traditions and had special knowledge in the science of hadith and other related sciences. He obtained principles, processed them and read out the seven qira'at (recitations) to a group of experts in qira'aat (recitations).33

Taj al-Din Ibn Maktum: a glimpse of his life

Another scholar who has discredited and questioned the credibility of Hadith of al- Nujum is Taj al-Din Ibn Maktum (d. 749 A.H.) Attesting to the sayings of his teacher,

Abu Hayyan, whom we have talked about before, he (Ibn Maktum) has related his very statement about the Hadith of al-Nujum from Al-Bahr al-Muhit in his (Ibn Maktum's) Al-Dur al-Laqit min al-Bahr al-Muhit. It is pertinent to mention that Ibn Maktum's biography is presented with praise in different Sunni sources. Jalaluddin Suyuti has said about him:

"Ahmad bin Adul Qadir bin Ahmad bin Maktum Taj al-Din Abu Muhammad al-Qaysi was an embodiment of jurisprudence, syntax and philology." He wrote the history book Al-Najat and Al-Dur al-Laqit min al-Bahr al-Muhit. He was born in the year 682 A.H. and departed in 749 A.H."34

Ibn Qayyim al-Jawzi: a glimpse of his life

Another Sunni scholar who has criticized the soundness of Hadith of al-Nujum is Ibn Qayyim al-Jawzi (d. 751 A.H.). He has discredited the Hadith of al-Nujum and has commented in rejection of the "imitators" and their reasons as follows:

The forty fifth reason is this saying of theirs: For the validity of emulation this well- known hadith suffices

that: "My companions are like the stars, whomever among them you follow, you will be guided."

The answer to this saying can be given from several perspectives: One is that this hadith has been transmitted by way of Al-A'mash from Abu Sufyan bin Jabir from Saeid bin al-Musayyib's hadith from Ibn Umar, and by way of Hamza al-Jazri from Nafi' from Ibn Umar, and none of them is proven and authenticated.

He goes on to say:

Ibn Abd al-Barr said: Muhammad bin Ibrahim bin Saeid has related to us that Abu Abdullah bin Mufarraj has narrated to him on the authority of Muhammad bin Ayyub Samut that Bazzaz has said: As for what is related from the Prophet (S) as having said, "*My companions are like the stars, whomever among them you follow, you will be guided"* is not a sound hadith from the Prophet , peace be upon him and his family, because it has not been reported through a valid chain of transmission.35

Now we shall take a brief look at Ibn Qayyim al-Jawzi's life. Most biography books have mentioned and praised him. Ibn Kathir says about him: "On Thursday night, the 13th of the month of Rajab, our friend, Al-Shaykh al-Imam al-Allama Shams al-Din, the leader of al-Jawziya and their custodian, died.

He began his education by acquiring knowledge of Ilm al-Hadith. He carried on his studies until he acquired proficiency in several branches of sciences including exegesis, hadith, theology, jurisprudence etc.

He recited the Quran beautifully and was well-mannered. He was kind and never felt jealous of anyone nor did he hurt anyone. He did not backbite anyone nor did he carry any spite against any people.36

Zayn al-Din Iraqi

Another scholar who has rejected Hadith of al-Nujm and considered it as inauthentic is Zayn al-Din Iraqi (d. 806 A.H). He has the following to say about the Hadith of al- Nujum:

The hadith "My companions are like the stars, whomever among them you follow, you will be guided" has been related by Daru Qutni in Al-Fadha'il, and Ibn Abd al-Barr in his Jami' Bayan Al-'Ilm has narrated from Jabir's hadith on his own authority that: "This isnad is not authentic and there is nothing to indicate that it is authentic, since al-Harith bin Ghusayn, one of its narrators, is unknown and anonymous.

He also relates:

Abd bin Humaid has related it in his Musnad and Ibn Adi has related it in Al-Kamil from the narration by Hamza bin Abi Nusaybi from Nafi' from Umar by the phrase "whomever among them you adopt his words " instead of "you followed" and said that "its isnad is weak because of the presence of Abu Hamza, as he is accused of lying.

Also, Bayhaqi in his Al-Madkhal has related it from Amr and Ibn Abbas and the same hadith in another way with an incomplete isnad (mursal) and has said that: "Its text is well-known but its isnad is poor and unproven."

Bazzaz has also quoted Abdur Rahim bin Zayd Ammi who narrated from his father, from Ibn Umar that he said: "This hadith is unknown and inauthentic."

Ibn Hazm has commented on this tradition. He says: "This tradition is false, fabricated and invalid."

Bayhaqi's remark about this tradition is the following: Part of this tradition (My companions are like stars) is implied by Abu Musa's tradition which has been reported by Muslim Neishaburi. In that hadith, the Holy Prophet (S) has been quoted as having said:

*"The stars are security for inhabitants of the heavens .... and my companions are security for my ummah..."*37

Now we shall take a look at Zayn al-Din Iraqi's life. All lexicographers and biographers have praised and admired him. Ibn Imad has said about him in the events of the year 806/1404: "The memorizer [of the Qur'an] Zayn al-Din Abd al-Rahim bin Iraq al- Shafi'ei, the memorizer of the age…departed from this world."38

Ibn Hajar Asqalani: a glimpse of his life

Shahab al-Din Ibn Hajar Asqalani has also questioned the credibility of Hadith of al- Nujum. The hadith "My companions are like stars, whomever among them you follow, you will be guided" is related by Abd bin Humaid in his Musnad on the authority of Hamza al-Nasibi from Nafi' from Ibn Amr; and Hamza is very weak [in transmission of hadith].

He also says:

Daru Qutni has related this hadith in his Al-Mutalif from the narration transmitted by Salam bin Sulaym from al-Harith bin Ghusayn from A'mash from Abu Sufyan from

Jabir in a marf‘ manner and said: "Salam [bin Sulaym] is weak" and has related it by way of Hamid bin Zayd in Malik's Ghara'ib from Ja'far bin Muhammad from His father from Jabir along with a hadith in which it is related:

"Then, whomever among my companions that you take his words, you will be guided; indeed, my companions are comparable to stars, whoever follows one star from among them will be guided" and has said: "It is not proved to be from Malik, and its transmitters, except for Malik, are unknown."

And Abd bin Humaid and Daru Qutni have related it in Al-Fadha'il from the hadith of Hamza Jazri from Nafi' from Ibn Hamza and said: "Hamza has been accused of fabrication of hadith."

In Musnad al-Shahab, Qadha'i also has quoted Abu Huraira with a chain of transmitters including Ja'far bin Abdul Wahid Hashemi whose reports biographers have rejected and discredited.

And Ibn Tahir has related it from the tradition of Bushr bin Hussein from Zubayri, from Anas that Bushr too was accused of lying.

And Bayhaqi has related it in Al-Madkhal from the narration of Juwaybir from Dhahhak, from Ibn Abbas as saying: "Juwaybir is an abandoned individual". Also, he has related it from the narration of Juwaybir from Jawab bin Abdullah in a marfu' (lit. elevated) manner which in this case would be mursal (incomplete in chain of transmitters). Bayhaqi then says: This text is famous but all its chains of transmission are poor.

Similarly, he has related the following in Al-Madkhal from Ibn Umar, albeit in a marfu' manner that the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his family, said:

"I asked my Lord about what my companions would differ in after me. Then, He revealed to me: O Muhammad! To Me your companions are like stars in the sky, some of them are brighter than others; so, to Me, whoever takes hold of any of the things they differ about would be rightly guided."

Then under this tradition, he comments as such: "Among the narrators of this hadith is Abdur Rahim bin Zayd al-Ammi who is abandoned."[39]

Now, we shall take a short look at Ibn Hajar Asqalani's life. He has been remembered with respect and admiration. Jalaluddin Suyuti writes about him: "He was leading among the memorizers in his time, the chief justice (qadhi al-qudhat) with students from different parts of the country. During his time, there was no memorizer except him.

He wrote many books on different subject. Some of the books authored by him are the following: Sharh Bukhari, Ta'liq al-Ta'liq, Tahdhib al-Tahdhib, Taqrib al-Tadhib, Lisan al-Mizan, Al-Isabah fi Ma'refat al-Sahabah, Nokat Ibn al-Salah, Rijal al-Arba'ah and its Exposition and Al-Alqab.[40]

Ibn al-Hammam: a glimpse of his life

Kamal al-Din Muhammad bin Abdul Wahid al-Siwasi, better known as Ibn Hammam al-Hanafi (d. 861) was one of the leaders of the Hanafi School. He has expressly said that the Hadith of al-Nujum is an unknown hadith.[41]

Ibn al-Hammam is a celebrated leader. Historians and biographers have narrated his biography with respect and dignity. Ibn Imad has said about him in the events of the year 861/1456: "And in this year Kamal al-Din Muhammad bin Abdul Wahid al-Siwasi al-Iskandari, the leading Hanafi scholar died."

It has been reported in Bughyat al-Wu'at that Ibn Hammam was a man of profuse knowledge and an

expert in jurisprudence, legal theories, syntax, deflections, eloquence, Sufism, music and a lot of other sciences. He used to say: "I do not follow anyone in rational sciences."42

Ibn Amir al-Haj: a glimpse of his life

Another Sunni scholar who has criticized the soundness of Hadith of al-Nujum is Shams al-Din Muhammad bin Muhammad, better known as Amir al-Haj Hanafi (d. 879 A.H.). He has clearly stated the weakness and invalidity of Hadith of al-Nujum:

It is also replied that: Each one of these two traditions i.e. "my companions are like stars" and "take half of your religion from Aisha" are contradictory as it signifies the permissibility of following the companions and Aisha, even though it may be opposite to the words of the two Sahykhs [Abu Bakr and Umar] or the four caliphs. Of course, the first hadith [i.e., the hadith of stars] is not known.

He also said:

According to Ibn Hazm in his significant treatise [Risalat al-Kubra], it is an invalid and fabricated hadith, although it has its own ways (turuq) of transmission through Amr bin Umar, Jabir, Ibn Abbas, and Anas in different wordings, the closest of which to the wordings of the hadith is the one reported from Umar by Ibn Adi in Al-Kamil and Ibn Abd al-Barr in Bayan al-'Ilm as follows:

The Apostle of Allah (S) said: "My companions are comparable to the stars by which the people are guided, whomever among them you adopt his words, you will be guided."

And the hadith that Daru Qutni and Ibn Abd al-Barr have related from Jabir is as follows:

The Apostle of Allah (S) said:

"My companions among my umma are like stars, whomever among them you follow, you will be guided".

Yes, nothing of this hadith is true and reported through a valid chain of transmission, and for this reason Ahmad bin Hanbal said: "The hadith is unsound."

Bazzaz said: "This hadith is not true and cannot be from the Prophet, peace be upon him and his family." Meanwhile, Bayhaqi has said in his Al-I'tiqad: We have received this tradition in an uninterrupted (muttasil) and not-strong enough sanad (chain of transmission) and in another hadith with an interrupted [munqati'] sanad.

Of course, the authentic tradition which constitutes part of the concept of this tradition asserts that it is Abu Musa's hadith that has been related in a marfu'ah (elevated) way.43

Now, we shall take a brief a look at the life of Ibn Amir al-Haj. Great Sunni scholars have praised him. Ibn Imad has said about him: "Shams al-Din Muhammad bin Muhammad bin Hasan known as Ibn Amir

al-Haj al-Halabi al-Hanafi, had been the head of Hanafi scholars in Aleppo. He was a leading scholar and a writer who wrote invaluable and famous books. He had many great students who were proud of studying with him. He died at the age of 54 in the city of Aleppo in the month of Rajab.44

Getting to Know Sakhawi

Another prominent Scholar who has commented on Hadith of al-Nujum is Shams al-Din Abu al-Khayr Muhammad bin Abdu Rahman bin Muhammad bin Abi Bakr bin Uthman bin Muhammad Sakhawi. In this regard, he says:

"The tradition which says that 'difference of opinion among my ummah is a blessing' has been reported by Bayhaqi in al-Madkhal from Sulayman bin Abu Karimah, from Juwaybir, from Dhahhak, from Ibn Abbas who said: One day the Apostle of Allah, peace be upon him and his family, said:

"What is given to you from the Book of Allah brings to you knowledge and no one is excused to abandon it; and if [*a ruling were*] *not in the Book of Allah, then refer to my past sunna; and if there were no sunna of mine available* [*in that respect*]*, then whatever my companions say* [*would be right*]*. Verily, my companions are like the stars in the sky, whomever among them you emulate, you will be guided, and the difference among my umma is a blessing".*

Quoting this hadith, Sakhawi says: This hadith has been reported by Tabarani and Deylami in their Musnads with the same chain of transmission.

It is pertinent to mention that one of the narrators of this tradition is Juwaybir who is seriously weak in narrating traditions. Moreover, Dhahhak's report from Ibn Abbas is interrupted. That is to say, there is a gap between Dhahhak and Ibn Abbas.45

Now, we shall take a cursory look at Sakhawi's life and personality by referring to some biographical books. His biography is given in most of the biographical and historical books. Ibn Imad writes in the events of the year 902 A.H: It was in this year that Shams al-Din Abu al-Khayr Muhammad bin Abdu Rahman bin Muhammad bin Abi Bakr bin Uthman bin Muhammad Sakhawi died.

He excelled in jurisprudence, Arabic, recitation, hadith and history. He also took part in mathematics, exegesis, principles of jurisprudence, meeqat and a lot of other fields of science.

The things he has read and which have been reported from him are innumerable. He acquired knowledge from a group of scholars consisting of more than 400 people. Many scholars allowed him to give fatwa, present lectures and dictate.

He acquired and sought much of his knowledge from his teacher, Ibn Hajar Asqalani. For example, Sakhawi is said to be next to Ibn Hajar Asqalani in the science of Jarh and Ta'dil (criticism of narrators). Also, it is said that Sakhawi excelled in Ilm al-Rijal or biographical evaluation (.lit "knowledge of men")

and there was none, except Zahabi, to follow his methodology.[46]

Ibn Abi Sharif Shafi'ei: a glimpse of his life

Another scholar has criticized and discredited Hadith of al-Nujum is Kamal al-Din Ibn Abi Sharif Shafi'ei (d. 906 A.H.). In this regard, he has followed his master Ibn Hajar Asqalani. Quoting the latter, he has discredited Hadith of al-Nujum as shall be brought up in the later sections when we shall bring up Manawi's words and comments.

It is pertinent to mention that his biography has been related in many biographical and historical books. Ibn Imad has said about him: Kamal al-Din Abu al-Ma'ali, Muhammad bin Amir Naser al-Din Muhammad bin Abi Bakr bin Ali bin Abi Sharif Muqaddasi Shafi'ei Marri, grandson of Shahab al-Din Umairi Maliki known as Ibn 'Awjan. He was Shaykh al-Imam, Shaykh al-Islam, the king of the notable scholars."[47]

Jalal al-Din Suyuti: a glimpse of his life

Another prominent scholar who has criticized the soundness of Hadith of al-Nujum is Jalal al-Din Suyuti (d. 911 A.H.). He has quoted the Hadith of al-Nujum in his Al-Jami' al-Saghir min Ahadith al-Bashir al-Nadhir, and in the end marked it with the letter "d" [da'□f = weak], which was his code for weakness of the hadith.[48]

We will now take a cursory look at his life. Ibn Imad has said about him in the events of the year 911: "And in that year, the memorizer Jalal al-Din al-Suyuti Shafi'ei, the great traditionist, researcher, profound thinker and the author of many useful writings, died."

Dawoodi, his student says: "Suyuti has been the most learned scholar of his age in the science of hadith and its skills."[49]

Ali Muttaqi Hindi: a glimpse of his life

Another prominent scholar who has criticized the soundness of Hadith of al-Nujum is Shaykh Ali Muttaqi Hindi (d. 975 A.H.). He has pointed out the Hadith of al-Nujum in his famous book Kanz al-Ummal as well as in Muntakhab al-Kanz and has proclaimed it to be weak in the same way as Suyuti (his master) did.[50]

Muttaqi Hindi's biography is recorded with compliments and respect. Ibn Imad has said about him: "Ali al-Muttaqi bin Hesam al-Din Hindi Makki was from among the practicing scholars and the pious servants of Allah.

He was a God-fearing man, a man of continence and devotion and renunciation of evil actions. He

authored many books and held many statuses and posts. Muttaqi Hindi lived for many years in the holy city of Mecca. He died in the same city and was buried in the Mu'alla cemetery.51

Getting to Know Ali Qari

Sheikh Ali Qari Makki has also discredited and criticized Hadith of al-Nujum. He has quoted Ibn Rabi' as saying: As reported by Jalal al-Din al-Suyuti in Takhrij Ahdith al- Shifa, the tradition "My companions are like stars" has been reported by Ibn Majah. To be honest, I did search Ibn Majah's Sunan to find this tradition but I did not find it.

Moreover, Ibn Hajar has quoted it in Takhrij Ahadith al-Rafi'i in the chapter Adab al- Qadha and has sufficiently talked about it, adding that: "This hadith is weak and insignificant"; furthermore, he has quoted Ibn Hazm as saying: "This [i.e. Hadith of al- Nujum] is fabricated and invalid."

Meanwhile, he has quoted Bayhaqi as saying: "There is a tradition which Muslim Neishaburi has narrated and which implicitly refers to the said hadith. That is the hadith in which the Holy Prophet (S) has been quoted as having said:

*"The stars are peace for inhabitants of the heavens .... and my companions are peace for my ummah..."*52

Ibn Hajar comments: Bayhaqi has told the truth. This hadith draws similarity between the companions and the stars but it makes no reference to following or imitating them. Indeed, being guided by stars also seems to require emulating the stars.

Sheikh Ali Qari has said under the same comment: "It seems that being guided is something that requires emulation."

He goes on saying: The hadith apparently refers to seditions which took place after the extinction of the companions in the wake of which the traditions were destroyed, the innovations emerged and injustices spread across the land.

Thereupon, Sheikh Ali Qari says: Ibn al-Subki has reported this tradition in Sharh Ibn al-Hajib while discussing the justice of the companions but he has ascribed it to Ibn Majah.

In his Jami al-Usul, Ibn Athir has narrated this tradition in a marfu' (lit. elevated)53 manner from Ibn Musayyib from Umar bin Khattab that the Apostle of Allah, peace be upon him and his family, said:

"I asked my Lord..."

Having narrated this hadith, he then says that this tradition is among the traditions which Razin has narrated in Tajrid al-Usul and which he (Ibn Athir) did not come to know about in the said Usul.

The author of Al-Mishkat has also mentioned it and has thereupon said: "This tradition has been narrated by Razin."[54]

Now we take a cursory look at the life of Sheikh Ali Qari. Muhibbi has commented about him: "Ali bin Muhammad bin Sultan Herawi known as Qari, resident in Mecca and one of the fountainheads of knowledge, and peerless in his time. He had an amazing method in research and exposition of passages.

His reputation is enough to be an indication of his traits." He is well-known and spoken about everywhere. He authored many valuable books the most important and the greatest of which is his Mirqat fi Sharh al-Mishkat which consists of several volumes.

Getting to Know Abdur Rauf Manawi

Another prominent scholar who has criticized the soundness of Hadith of al-Nujum is Abdur Rauf Manawi (d. 1029). He narrates this tradition from the Holy Prophet (S) who said:

"I asked my Lord about what my companions would differ in after me..."

In exposition of this hadith he says: Al-Sajzi has reported this tradition in Al-Ibanah 'An Usul al-Diyanah, Ibn Asaker al-Dimashqi in the History of the City of Damascus (Tarikh Madinat al-Dimashq) when narrating Zayd al-Hawari's biographical account. As well, Bayhaqi and Ibn Adi have narrated this tradition from Umar bin Khattab.

Ibn Jawzi has related in Al-'Ilal: "This hadith is not sound" and Nu'aym [one of its transmitters] is discredited; and Ibn Mu'een has viewed Abd al-Rahim as liar and untrustworthy. It has been said in Mizan al-I'tidal: "This hadith is invalid."

Similarly, Ibn Hajar has said in Takhrij al-Mukhtasar: It [the hadith of al-Nujum] is an unusual tradition about which Bazzaz was asked and he replied: "This saying has not been reported from the Holy Prophet (S) through a valid chain of transmission."

Also, Kamal bin Abi Sharif said: "It is implied from the words of our teacher (Ibn Hajar) that this hadith [of al-Nujum] is a confused (mudhtarib) tradition."

Manawi further adds: It seems that according to the writer's view, Ibn Asaker has quoted this tradition and he has refrained from commenting on it whereas the fact is not as such because Ibn Asaker says after quoting the hadith: Ibn Sa'd said: "Zayd al-Ammi Abu al- Hawari was weak in narrating hadith and Ibn Adi says about him: "All of the individuals which he has reported traditions from and all of those who have narrated from him are poor (dha'if) in terms of reporting traditions."[55]

Now we shall look briefly at the life of Abdur Rauf Manawi. Biographers have remembered him and

spoken about him with awe and respect. Muhibbi has commented about him: "Abdur Rauf bin Taj al-Arefeen bin Ali bin Zayn Al-Abedin titled Zayn al- Din al-Haddadi al-Manawi, al-Qahiri al-Shafi'ei, [was] a great religious leader, an authoritative and trustable exemplar with well-known works."

Without doubt, he was a great scholar of his age. He was a learned, pious, devoted and humble leader submissive to God. He was highly esteemed. He sought nearness to God by doing good deeds. He was patient and tolerant remembering God constantly and continually. He sufficed to eating only one meal during the day and night. He acquired knowledge of different sciences and disciplines in his time excelling all his contemporaries.

Shahab Khafaji: a glimpse of his life

In his Sharh al-Shifa, Sheikh Shahab al-Din Khafaji (d. 1096) has admitted the weakness of Hadith of al-Nujum. Then, in order to reject Abuzar Halabi – who has protested Qadhi 'Ayadh's act of narrating the hadith in al-Shifa in a decisive manner – he has embarked on defending Qadhi Ayadh.

Khafaji's biography has been brought up in many biographical books. Mohibbi comments about him as such:

Sheikh Ahmad bin Muhammad bin Umar, the Chief Judge titled Shahab al-Din Khafaji, the Egyptian, the Hanafi, has authored many famous works. He is a scholar known for his excellence and skill among all other scholars. He was the moon of the sky of knowledge, the star of the horizon of prose and poem, the leader of writers and head of the authors. The glimmer of his fame encompassed the world and his name was uttered frequently by people like a proverb.

All those who had seen him – some of whom we have seen and some we have heard of– admit the fact that he was peerless in terms of meticulous and beautiful writing. None of the said people could compete him nor could they make such a claim. It was at a time when some people claimed to have merits which they never seemed to have. He authored a lot of interesting and acceptable books which can be found everywhere in the country…56

Qadhi Behari: a glimpse of his life

Qadhi Mohibullah Behari (d. 1119 A.H.) denied the authenticity of consensus (ijma') of Al-Shaykhayn or the two caliphs (Umar and Abu Bakr), and said:

"It is said in the narrations: "Follow those who come after me, namely, Abu Bakr and Umar", and "follow my sunna and the sunna of the guided caliphs". We must say: This tradition is addressed to the imitators (muqallidin) and implies the eligibility of emulating the caliphs. That was because the mujtahids [those who practiced ijtihad] opposed them and the imitators sometimes imitated people other than them.

As for the contradiction between the two traditions i.e. "My companions are like stars" and "Take half of

your religion from Al-Humayra (Aisha)" and the tradition reported in Al-Mukhtasar, this contradiction is resolved because these two traditions [the Hadith of al-Nujum and the Hadith which says "Take half of your religion"] are very weak."57

Behari's life has been brought up in biographical sources. Zirkili says about him:

Mohibullah bin Abd al-Shakoor Behari Hindi engaged in Judgment and he was considered to be one of the notable scholars of the city of Behar which is a big city located on east India.

Behari was born in a place named Karah. Later he was appointed as the judge of Lucknow and then of Dakan district. In the following years, Behari became the ruler of the state of India and was granted the title "Fazil Khan" but he died immediately thereafter.

Among the works authored by him are Musallam al-Thubut fi Usul al-Fiqh, al-Jawhar al-Fard, Sullam al-Ulum fil Mantiq etc. 58

Qadhi Shawkani: a glimpse of his life

Qadhi Shawkani (d. 1250 A.H) commented about consensus (ijma'):

And in this manner, the hadith "My companions are like stars, whomever among them you follow, you will be guided" implies the authenticity of the words of each one of them; [however] there is a widely known objection to this hadith because, the sanad (chain of transmission) includes Abd al-Rahim al-Ammi quoting his father, who are both very weak [in transmission of hadith].

Similarly, Ibn Mu'een has said: "Abd al- Rahim is a liar." Bukhari has described him as matr□k (abandoned). And Abi Hatam has asserted likewise.

This hadith has been related in another way, too, in which Hamza al-Nasibi is named as one of the transmitters. He [Shawkani] said about him: "He is very weak". Bukhari says: "Hamza al-Nasibi's ahadith (traditions) are unknown" and Ibn Mu'een has said, "He is not worth anything." Ibn Adi has said about him: "All his narrations are fabricated." Also it is related on the authority of Jamil bin Zayd about him: "He is unknown"59

Shawkani's biography has been presented in many biographical books authored by Sunni scholars. Zirkili says about him: "Muhammad bin Ali bin Muhammad bin Abdullah Shawkani was among the great Yemeni scholars and jurists who lived in Sana'a. He was born in Hijra of Shawkan, one of the districts of Yemen's Kholan province but then he moved to Sana'a and was brought up there.

In the year 1229, Shawkani was appointed as the judge of Sana'a and he died when he was the ruler of this city. He considered taqlid (imitation) to be forbidden and left behind 114 volumes of books.60

Muhammad Siddiq Hasan Khan: a glimpse of his life

Commenting on Idala al-Sahaba (the justice of the companions), Muhammad Siddiq Hasan Khan (d. 1307 A.H.) has found it sufficient to mention this hadith and say: His saying "My companions are like stars" has been extensively criticized.61

Siddiq Hasan Khan's biography has been presented in Sunni biographical sources. Zirkili says: Abu Tayyib Muhammad Siddiq Khan Hasan bin Ali bin Lotfullah Husseini Bukhari Qanauji is considered to be among the modernist figures of the Islamic movement. Born and brought up in the Indian town of Qanauj he was educated in Delhi.

He moved to Bhopal of India to earn his living and it was a great success for him as he managed to earn huge wealth. He writes about his own life: He settled in Bhopal and chose to live there. There he began to acquire wealth and reputation. He became a minister and then a member of the parliament. He also spent his life compiling and writing books.

He married Bhopal queen and was then honored with the title "Nawab, Bahadur Shah. He authored more than sixty books in various languages including Arabic, Farsi and Hindi.62

Hadith of al-Nujum and Other Scholars' Opinion

It is worth mentioning that the scholars and experts who have discredited and criticized Hadith of al-Nujum, are not restricted to those mentioned above. Many other thinkers have clearly asserted the weakness of this hadith, the details of which are omitted here for the sake of brevity.

Included among such thinkers are: Ibn Mulaqqin, Ibn Taymiya, Jalal al-Mahalla, Abu Nasr Sajazi, Abudhar al-Halabi, Ahmad bin Qasim al-Ibadi, Al- Subki, the author of Minhaj al-Usul, Abd al-Ali Bahr al-Ulum, the author of Sharh-i Muslim al-Thubut, and (from among the modern scholars): Muhammad Nasir al-Din Albani63 , and Sayyid Muhammad Aqil al-Alawi.64

All in all, it may be concluded from the viewpoints of these dignitaries that the prevailing view of both ancient and modern Sunni scholars concerning the Hadith of al- Nujum is that they allow the possibility of erring by the Sahaba and do not regard all of them as men of justice and do not believe in their immunity from mistakes and sins. It is pertinent to mention that the names of some of those scholars were mentioned in the beginning of this book.

And the reason for stating the biographies of the renowned Sunni dignitaries from their own books of biography was for the readers to know that the invalidity and illusiveness of the Hadith of al-Nujum has been uttered by the Sunni scholars and dignitaries.

Supplementary Discussion

As we pointed out before, some of the channels through which the Hadith of al-Nujum has been transmitted include another hadith as well. In that hadith, it is stated that the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his family, has been quoted as having said:

"The difference among my umma is a blessing."

Some Sunni traditionists (muhaddithin) have considered the chains of the transmission of both traditions as poor. Therefore, it is befitting to mention the sayings of the traditionists concerning this tradition. Zayn al-Din Iraqi says:

In his Resalah al-Ash'ariyah, Bayhaqi has mentioned this tradition in the form of ta'liq (hadith missing its beginning) whereas he has narrated the hadith in Al-Madkhal in the form of musnad from Ibn Abbas that the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his family, said:

"The difference among my umma is a blessing for you."

Then Zayn Iraqi says: "This hadith has a weak chain of transmission." 65 Muhammad Tahir Hindi (d. 986)66 writes in Al-Maqasid:

The hadith "The difference among my umma is a blessing" has been narrated by Bayhaqi as part of a long tradition in an elevated (marfu') manner from Dhahhak from Ibn Abbas. Part of the hadith as quoted by Ibn Abbas says: "The difference among my umma is a blessing for you."

Tabarani and Deylami have also narrated this tradition in the same manner as Bayhaqi. It has to be noticed that Dhahhak narrates the above tradition in an interrupted and disconnected way. Zayn Iraqi says, "This hadith is mursal (hurried)67 and weak."68

Muhammad Naser al-Din Albani, a contemporary scholar, while quoting some scholars about this hadith says that this hadith is undocumented and baseless.69

Now that we have mentioned prominent Sunni scholars' sayings and opinions in rejection and criticism of Hadith of al-Nujum let us have a cursory look at how this hadith has been transmitted by the narrators and transmitters so that we may know in detail the Sunni scholars' perspectives about it.

1. It goes without saying that points quoted or mentioned in praise of Sunni scholars are meant to show their status among Sunni Muslims in respect of refuting and rejecting the fabricated "Hadith Al-Nujum", or else Shiites do not subscribe to these endorsements.
2. Al-Taqrir al-Tahbir fi Sharh al-Tahrir, 3/99; Al-Taysir fi Sharh al-Tahrir, 3/243; Silsilat al-Ahadith al- Dhaifah wa al-Mawdhu'ah, 1/79
3. Shaykh al-Islam is a title of superior authority in the issues of Islam.
4. For further information about Ahmad bin Hanbal, vide: History of Baghdad, 4/412; Hulyat-ul Awliya, 9/161; Tabaqat al-Shafe'iyah, 2/27 – 63; Tazkirat al-Huffaz, 2/17; Wafiyat al-A'yan, 1/47; 1/47; Shazarat al-Zahab, 2/96; Al-Nujum al-Zahera,

2/304, etc.

5. Jami' Bayan al-Ilm wa Fadhlehi, 2/923.

6. Al-Bani, one of the contemporaries say: It seems that the text of this hadith is against the meaning understood by Mazna. In fact, it refers to utterances made by the companions according to their own opinions. Therefore, the meaning of the hadith indicative of it being fabricated and ascribed falsely to the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his family. That because we cannot imagine that the Prophet, peace be upon him and his family, allowed us to follow every companion despite the fact that there were people exercising precaution. His prayers were answered and none of the Shafi'eites considered himself superior to him. He was also the individual who gave ritual ablution (ghus) to Imam Shafi'ei.

7. For further information in this regard, vide: Wafiyat al-A'yan, 1/196; Mer'at al-Jenan, 2/177 and 178; Tabaqat al-Shafe'eyah, 2/93 and 109; Al-'Ibar, 2/28; Hosn al-Muhadherah, 1/ 307.

8. Jami' Bayan al-Ilm wa Fadhlehi, 2/923 and 924. Vide: E'lam al-Mawqe'ayn, 2/232, Al-Bahr al-Mohit fi Tafsir al-Quran, 5/528 etc.

9. Vide: Tradition of Prophet or of the Caliphs: a series of ideological researches, No. 23 by the same author.

10. For further information about his life, vide: History of Baghdad, 4/334; Tazkerat al-Huffaz, 2/228; Shazarat al-Dhahb, 2/209; History of Isfahan, 1/104; Mizan al-E'tidal, 1/59; Al-'Ebar, 2/92.

11. For further information about Ibn Adi, vide: Al-Ansar, Nasab Jorjani, Tazkerat al-Huffaz, 3/161; Shazarat al-Zahab, 3/51; Mer'at al-Jenan, 2/ 381. Al-'Ibar, 2/337.

12. Al-Kaf al-Shaf fi Takhrij Ahadith al-Kashaf, 2/603.

13. Ra'y is used when there is an unresolved matter for which no firm or indirect regulations in the Koran or the hadiths can be found.

14. Al-Bahr al-Muhit fi Tafsir al-Quran, 5/528. Vide: Silsilat al-Ahadith al-Dha'eifa wal-Mawdhu'ah, 1/78.

15. Literalism is the interpretation or translation of the explicit and primary sense of words of the Quran and traditions. Thus, according to it one has to act upon the outward meaning of the words of the narrations without having to interpret them.

16. Lisan al-Mizan, 4/ 239 – 241.

17. For further information about Ibn Hazm, vide: Nafah al-Tayyib, 1/364; Al-Ibar, 3/239; Wafiyat al-A'yan, 3/7- 13; Taaj al-Aroos, 8/245; Lisan al-Mizan, 4/198.

18. Al-Kaf al-Shaf fi Takhrij Ahadith al-Kashaf, 2/604

19. For further information about Bayhaqi, vide: Shazarat al-Zahab, 3/304; Tabaqat al-Shafe'iyah, 4/ 168; Al-Ibar, 3/242; al-Nujum al-Zahera, 5/ 77, Wafiyah al-A'yan, 1/57 & 58; Tazkerat al-Huffaz, 3/309.

20. Jami Bayan al-Ilm wa Fadhlehi, 924 & 925.

21. For further information about him vide: Wafiyat al-A'yan, 6/63; Mer'at al-Jenan, 3/89; al-Mukhtasar, 2/ 187 and 188; Al-Ibar, 3/ 255; Tazkerat al-Huffaz, 3/349; Taaj al-Aroos, 3/37.

22. For further information about him vide: Tabaqat al-Shafe'eyah, 4/273; Al-Mukhtasar, 3/ 59; Wafiyat al- A'yan, 2/471; al-Ibar, 3/ 212; Mer'at al-Jenan, 3/393; Tatimmat al-Mukhtasar, 2/124; Mu'jam al-Udaba, 13/ 773 and 78; Al-Bedayah wa al-Nehayah, 12/294.

23. Al-Ilal al-Mutanahiyah fi al-Ahadith al-Wahiyah, 1/283. Vide: Faydh al-Qadir, 4/101.

24. For further information about him vide: Al-Bedayah wa al-Nehayah, 13/28; Wafiyat al-A'yan, 2/321 and 322; Tatimmat al-Mukhtasar, 2/118; Al-A'laam, 4/4/89 and 90.

25. Takhrij Ahadth al-Minhaj, Baydhawi, 85.

26. For further information about Ibn Dihya, vide: Bughyat al-Wu'at, 2/218; Shazarat al-Zahab, 4/160; Wafiyat al-A'yan, 3/121; Husn al-Muhadhera, 1/355.

27. Surah al-Najm, verse 3.

28. Surah al-Nisa, verse 115.

29. Al-Bahr al-Mohit fi Tafsir al-Quran, 5/527 & 528.

30. For further information about him, see: Al-Durar al-Kaminah, 4/302; Fawat al-Wafiyat, 2/555.

31. Bughyat al-Wu'at, 1/280 & 281; Al-Badr al-Tali', 2/288; Tabaqat al-Qura, 2/285; Nafhal-Tib, 3/289; Shazarat al-Zahab, 6/145 & 146; al-Nujum al-Zahera, 10/111.

32. M□zan al-I'tidal, 2/141 &142.

33. For further information about him, vide: Al–Durar al–Kaminah, 3/336 – 338; Tabaqat al–Shafi'eyah, 5/216; Fawat al–Wafiyat, 2/370 – 372; Al–Badr al–Tali', 2/110 and 112; al–Wafi bil–Wafiyat, 2/163 – 168; Shazarat al–Zahab, 6/153; Al–Nujum al–Zahera, 1/182; Tabaqat al–Qura', 2/71.

34. For further information about him, vide: Al–Durar al–Kaminah, 1/174; Husn al–Muhadhera, 1/47; Tabaqat al–Qura', 1/70; Al–Jawaher al–Mudhi'ah fi Tabaqat al–Hanifa, 1/75.

35. I'lam al–Mawqi'ayn, 2/231 & 232.

36. For further information about his life, vide: Al–Durar al–Kaminah, 3/400 – 403; Al–Badr al–Tali', 2/143 – 146; Al–Wafi bil–Wafiyat, 2/270 – 272, Bughyat al–Wu'at, 1/62 and 63, Tarikh Ibn Kathir, 14/234.

37. Takhrij Ahadith al–Minhaj, Baydhawi, 81–86. Bayhaqi's chain of transmission in Al–Madkhal will soon be proven to be weak and inauthentic. This is the tradition reported from Ibn Abbas and incorporating the hadith of 'Ikhtilaf'.

38. For further information about his life, vide: Tabaqat al–Qura, 1/382; Al–Dhaw' al–Lami', 4/171 – 178; Al– Badr al–Tali', 1/354 – 356, Shazarat al–Zahab, 7/55 and 56.

39. Al–Kaf al–Shaf fi Takhrij Ahadith al–Kashaf, 2/603 & 604.

40. For further information about him, vide: Husn al–Muhadherah, 1/363 – 316; Al–Badr al–Tali', 1/87 – 92, Al–Dhaw' al–Lami', 2/36– 4–; Shazarat al–Zahab, 8/270 – 273, etc.

41. Al–Tahrir bi–Sharh Amir Badshah Husseini, 3/243 (under consensus).

42. For further information about him, vide: Al–Badr al–Tali', 1/201 & 202; Husn al–Muhadherah, 1/474; Bughyat al–Wu'at, 1/166 – 169; Hadyat al–Arefeen, 2/201; Al–Taysir fi Sharh al–Tahrir, 1/3 & 4; Shazarat al–Zahab, 7/298, etc.

43. Al–Taghrir wa al–Takhyir fi Sharh al–Tahrir, 3/99; Vide: Al–Taysir fi Sharh al–Tahrir, 3/243.

44. For further information about him, vide: Al–Daw' al–Lami', 9/210/ Shazarat al–Zahab, 6/328; Al–Badr al– Tali', 2/254, etc.

45. Al–Maqasid al–Hasanah fi Bayan Kathir min al–Ahadith al–Mushtahira Alaa al–Alsenah, 46.

46. For further information about him, refer to Shazarat al–Zahab, 8/15 – 17; Mufakehat al–Khallan, 1/178; Al–Daw' al–Lami', 8/2 – 32; Al–Badr al–Tali', 2/184; Al–Noor al–Saafir, 16, etc.

47. For further information about him, vide: Al–Daw' al–Lami', 9/64 – 67; Al–Badr al–Tali', 2/243 & 244; Al– Uns al–Jalil, 2/288; Mufakehat al–Khullan, 1/126 and 211; Shazarat al–Zahab, 8/29, etc .

48. Al–Jami' al–Saghir, 2/287, letter "s", No. 4603.

49. For further information about him, vide: Husn al–Muhadharah, 1/335 & 344; Al–Badr al–Tali', 1/328, 335, Shazarat al–Zahab, 8/51, 55, Mufakihat al–Khullan, 1/294, etc.

50. Kanz al–Umma, 1/104; Kitab al–Iman wa al–Islam, second chapter on Belief in the Quran and Sunnah, hadith No. 913; Muntakhab Kanz al–Ummal, 1/117 & 118; Kitab al–Iman wa al–Islam, second chapter, al– E'atisam bil–Kitab wa al–Sunnah.

51. For further information about him, vide: Al–Noor al–Safir, 315 – 139, Sabhat al–Marjan, 34,

52. Vide page 60 of this book.

53. An attributed tradition is a tradition which is not prove to have a continuous chain of transmission.

54. Al–Mirqat fi Sharh al–Mishkat, 5/523. Also, it is pertinent to mention that in Sharh al–Shifa, 3/423 & 424, he has admitted that this hadith is weak. As well, this hadith has been reported in al–Mawdhu'at al– Kubra page 372.

55. Faydh al–Qadir, 4/101.

56. For further information about him, vide: Khulasat al–Athar, 1/331–333, Reyahanat al–Albaa, 272 – 309, Al–E'lam, 1/227 and 228, etc.

57. Musallam al–Thubut, bi–Sharh al–Ansari, 2/231.

58. For further information about him, vide: Sabhat al–Marjan, 76 –78; Abja al–Ulum, 905; Kashf al–Dhunun, Hadiyat al–Arefeen Idhah al–Maknoon wa al–E'lam, 6/169.

59. Irshad al–Fohul, 126.

60. For further information about Shawkani, vide: Al–Badr al–Tali', 2/214 & 225; Abjad al–Ulum, 877, al– E'lam, 7, 190 & 191 etc.

61. Husul al–Ma'mool min Ilm al–Usul, 56.

62. For further information about him, vide: Al–E'lam, 7, 36 and 37; Abjad al–Ulum, 939; Idhah al– Maknoon, 1/10, etc.

63. Silsilat al–Ahadith al–Dhaifah wa al–Mawdhu'ah, 1/78.

64. Al–Nasayih al–Kafiyah, 181 – 182.

65. Al-Mughni 'An Haml al-Asfar (printed on margin of Ihya al-Ulum), 1/27.
66. For further information, vide: Shazarat al-Zahab, 8/410; Al-Noor al-Safir, 261 and Abjad al-Ulum, 3/224.
67. If the narrator between the Successor and Muhammad is omitted from a given isnad, the tradition is said to be mursal.
68. Tadhkerat al-Mawdhu'at, 90 & 91.
69. Silsilat al-Ahadith al-Dha'ifah wa al-Mawdhu'ah, 1/76 – 78.

The Narrators of Hadith of al-Nujum

Although the Hadith of al-Nujum is famous among Sunni scholars and has various chains of transmission, none of which has been left immune from the sneers of the Sunni eminent scholars and experts of al-jarh wa al-ta'dil.

Abdullah bin Umar's Narration and Its Narrators

The hadith of al-Nujum has been related from Abdullah bin Umar and there exists in its sanad the name of the following people:

Abdur Rahim bin Zayd

If anyone refers to Bukhari's Al-Dhu'afa', Nisai's Al-Dhu'afa', Ibn Abi Hatam's Al-'Ilal, Ibn Jawzi's Al-Mawdhu'at and Al-'Ilal al-Mutinahiya, Zahabi's Mizan al-I'tidal, Al- Kashif, and Al-Mughni, Khazraji's Khulasatu Tadhhib al-Kamal, and other reliable sources, they will notice frequent words of sneers and reprehensions about this person; such as "he is insignificant", "a liar", "weak", "the evil liar".

We have already mentioned some of the eminent Sunni scholars' view and sayings about him in different parts of this book.

Zayd Ammi

Another narrator who has narrated this tradition is Zayd Ammi. The weakness of this person has also been asserted; however, we have already quoted Manawi as relating from Ibn Adi that: "All of the traditions narrated from him and those who narrated from him are weak."

Hamza Jazri

The Hadith of al-Nujum is related from Abdullah bin Umar through another sanad in which Hamza Jazri is named one of the transmitters. It is reported in Bukhari's Al-Dhu'fa that Hamza bin Abu Hamza Nasibi has narrated unknown traditions. And in Nisai's Al- Dhu'afa' it has been said that Hamza Jazri 's narrations are abandoned."

Yahya'i has said in his Al-Mawdhu'at: "Hamza Jazri is insignificant" and Ibn Adi has said: "He fabricates hadith"; and in the same book Ahmad Hanbal and Yahya are reported as saying: "Hamza Jazri's

traditions are discarded."It is also reported from Yahya that "he is not worth anything".

Similar comments are reported from Abu Hayyan in Al-Bahr al- Muhit and from Zahabi in Al-Mizan and Al-Kashif and other books as mentioned before.

Umar bin Khattab's Narration and Its Narrators

Umar bin Khattab is also said to have narrated this hadith from the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his family, but there are the following people in the chain of the transmission of the narration:

Nu'aym bin Hammad

As we pointed out earlier, according to Ibn Jawzi, Nu'aym bin Hammad is weak and his report is, therefore, weak.

Abdu Rahim bin Zayd and Zayd Ammi

We have already mentioned Sunni scholars' viewpoints about these two narrators.

Jabir bin Abdullah Ansari's Narration and Its Narrators

This hadith has also been narrated by Jabir bin Abdullah Ansari but the narrators in the chain of the transmission of the narration are unknown. As we pointed our earlier, Ibn Hajar Asqalani writes in Takhrij Ahadith al-Kashaf:

Daru Qutni narrates this hadith from Humaid bin Zayd, from Malik, from Ja'far bin Muhammad from his father from Jabir putting it amongst the weird traditions. It has been narrated that the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his family, said:

"Whomever among them you adopt his words, you will be guided. My companions are comparable to the stars. One who follows one of the stars will be guided."

Daru Qutni says: Malik is not proved to have narrated this hadith. All of its narrators except Malik are unknown. This hadith has also been narrated with a different chain of transmission from Jaibr but the following people could be seen in the chains of its transmission:

Abu Sufyan

Ibn Hazm says: "Abu Sufyan is weak in terms of narrating hadith."1

Salam bin Sulaym

Ibn Hajar says: "Salam is weak in terms of narrating hadith."

In Hazm says: "Salam relates fabricated ahadith and this hadith [i.e., the Hadith of al- Nujum] is undoubtedly among such ahadith."

Ibn Kharash says: "Salam is a liar."

Ibn Habban has commented about him: "He has related fabricated ahadith". He has reported this in Silsilat al-Ahadith al-Mawdhu'ah wa al-Dha'ifa and added: "There is consensus on his weakness."

Harith bin Ghusayn

Ibn Abd al-Barr, said after reporting the hadith of al-Nujum from Jabir with the related chain of transmission (isnad): "This is the isnad which does not infer authenticity because Harith bin Ghusayn is not known."

As we pointed our earlier, Zayn Iraqi has narrated this saying of Ibn Abd al-Barr and he has favored it.

The Narration of Abdullah bin Abbas and Its Narrators

This hadith has also been narrated by Abdullah bin Abbas. However, names of the following people could be seen in its chain of transmission:

Sulayman bin Abu Karima

Abu Hatam Razi, Jalaluddin Suyuti, and Muhammad Tahir have considered him as weak. Ibn Adi said: "All of his traditions are rejected"; and Zahabi has said: "He is weak and possessor of unknown traditions."2

Juwaybir bin Saeid

Nisai has said about him in his Al-Dhu'afa: "His narrations are rejected." Bukhari has related in Al-Dhu'afa: "Juwaybir bin Saeid al-Balkhi has related hadith from al- Dhahhak. Ali bin Yahya said: I knew Juwaybir by two traditions; but after he narrated these traditions, he was regarded as weak."

Ibn Jawzi has said in Al-Mawdhu'at: "The scholars are unanimous about rejecting Juwaybir's narrations." Ahmad bin Hanbal has said: "No heed is paid to his traditions."

Zahabi has also commented about Juwaybir as such: Ibn Mu'een says: "Juwaybir is not taken into account." Jawzjani says: "No heed is paid to him."

And Nisai, Dar Qutni, and others have said: "His narrations are abandoned." It is also said in Al-Kashif: "The scholars have abandoned him."

Dhahhak bin Muzahim

It is reported about this person in Zahabi's Al-Mizan and Al-Mughni, Ibn Hajar Asqalani's Tahdhib al-Tahdhib, and other sources that: "No one was narrating hadith from Dhahhak bin Muzahim as he was weak in hadith and has been disparaged." Shu'ba and a group of other dignitaries have denied that this person had seen Ibn Abbas.

Abu Hurairah's Narration and Its Narrators

Where the Hadith of al-Nujum is related from Abu Huraira, there is in its sanad a person like Ja'far bin Abd al-Wahid al-Qadhi al-Hashemi, and as we refer to such books as Ibn Hajar 'Asqlani's Takhrij Ahadith al-Kashshaf and Lisan al-Mizan, Zahabi's Al-Mughni and Al-Mizan, and Jalal al-Din Suyuti's Al-Le'ali al-Masnu'a fi al-Ahadith al- Mawdhu'ah, we find that they have commented about him saying: "This man is accused of fabrication and plagiary of hadith; the hadith experts have rejected his traditions."

Yet, what is said here is regardless of the character of Abu Hurairah and the well-known story about him recorded in history.

The Narration of Anas bin Malik and Its Narrators

The Hadith of al-Nujum is related from Anas bin Malik, too; and there is such a name as Bushr bin al-Husayn in its chain of transmission. He has related hadith from Zubayr bin Adi from Anas. Zahabi has said in Al-Mughni fi al-Dhu'afa: "Daru Qutni has said that Bush bin al-Husayn is abandoned." Abu Hatam has said: "He has fabricated lies against al-Zubayr."3 Other comments expressed in his condemnation can be seen in Ibn Hajar's Lisan al-Mizan.4

1. Silsiilat al-Ahadith al-Dha'ifah wa al-Mawdhu'ah, 1/78.
2. On this issue we can refer to Ibn Jawzi's Al-Mawdhu'at, Zahabi's Mizan al-I'tidal and Al-Mughni, Ibn Hajar's Lisan al-Mizan, Muhammad Tahir's Qanun al-Mawdhu'at etc.
3. Al-Mughni fi al-Dhu'afa, 1/161.
4. Lisan al-Mizan, 2/28 – 30.

Questions about the Denotation of the Hadith

Having mentioned the hadith and the viewpoints of Sunni scholars regarding its narrators, now we would bring to your view the reasons for the invalidity of this hadith in terms of text and denotation. The questions which arise here in connection with the same hadith are:

Is the issuance of such a hadith possible on the part of the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his

family?

Were all the companions doing the right thing and treading the right path after the demise of the Prophet, peace be upon him and his family?

Were all of them eligible and qualified as leaders to be followed by Muslims?

Were all of them truly guided and guiding? If they were indeed so, why did God, the Glorified, say:

If then he dies or is killed will you turn back upon your heels?1

In another verse, the Holy Quran says:

"And from among those who are round about you of the dwellers of the desert there are hypocrites, and from among the people of Medina* (*also*)*; they are stubborn in hypocrisy; you do not know them; We know them; We will chastise them twice then shall they be turned back to a grievous chastisement."2

Furthermore, can we accept that the Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him and his family, was not aware of the future of the Muslim and the events unfolding after his demise? Never can we assume that he had no knowledge of the future events.

Indeed, Muslims believe that the Prophet, peace be upon him and his family, was aware of all future events among his companions and ummah until the day of resurrection as also evidenced by numerous traditions which clearly report that the Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him and his family, informed Muslims of future events.

The Prophet of Allah, peace be upon him and his family, has been quoted as having said:

*“My ummah will split into seventy-three sects."*3

The Prophet of God (S) Reprimanding Some of the Companions

There are numerous other traditions about the companions of the Prophet which clearly indicate that a lot of the companions suffer from a mental state of confusion and adopt the thoughts and ideals of the era of jahiliyah (ignorance) renouncing their faith and apostatizing after the demise of the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his family. For instance, we can point out a tradition which has been recorded in Sahih Bukhari. The Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his family, said:

I will enter the pond of abundance before you; but some of you will be pulled aside and kept away from me, then I say, “O, God! They are of my companions”, and God replies, “You are not aware what they did after you."

It has been reported in another tradition as such:

Then, I say, “May Allah’s blessings be away from those who distorted the religious commandments after me”.

In some other traditions, the Prophet (S) has been quoted as having said:

*"They turned back to what they were in the Age of Ignorance."*4

In another saying the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his family, addressed his companions as such:

*"Do not return to disbelief after me."*5

In another tradition, he said:

"Shirk among you people is more inconspicuous than the pace of an ant."6

In addition, the Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him and his family, has addressed the companions scornfully on different occasions and in many a number of places both individually and collectively. These traditions can be found in many Sunni books. Having said that, can it really be said that it was befitting for the Prophet, peace be upon him and his family, to introduce each and every one of his companions as a guiding star?

Despicable Acts Committed by Some Companions

Many companions of the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his family, including the prominent ones have, on various occasions and unexceptionally, admitted their ignorance, deficiency and mistakes in giving fatwa.

That was why, it was very normal and common for the companions to object and reject one another's views and opinions. Based on some historical accounts, the companions' act of refuting and rejecting one another's view crossed the moderate limit and reached an extent where they labeled one another as either ignorant or infidel.

If we go through the history, we find out that the companions did not consider themselves as guiding stars. Therefore, how can we consider for them a status which they themselves did not accept and believe in?

Swearing, physical and interpersonal violence and banishment of some companions by some others were common and the relations between them turned so sour that they were even prepared to shed one another's blood.

If we look carefully at the conducts of some of the companions, we come to know that many of them were indulged in committing unlawful acts so often that they even drank wine, bore false testimony, committed adultery, sold wine and idols, issued ignorant verdicts and did so many other major despicable acts which have been proved by Muslims to be major sins. Some of the sins committed by them are enumerated as follows:

Lying

Some of the prominent and well-known companions resorted to lying about 'How'ab in the event of the Jamal (Camel) sedition. Not only did they lie but they also persuaded others to give a false testimony.7

Khalid bin Walid's Crime

During Abu Bakr's era, Khalid bin Abdul Walid attacked upon Malik's tribesmen looting and plundering their property and taking them as captives. In this attack, Khalid bin Walid killed Malik bin Nuwayra, head of the clan, and contracted marriage with Malik's wife on the ensuing night without taking into account the mandatory iddah rule8. This unlawful act on the part of Khalid was later condemned and denounced by Umar bin Khattab.9

Adultery Committed by Mughayra

Mughayra bin Shu'aba committed adultery and the story has been recorded as follows:

Mughayra bin Shu'aba committed adultery with Umm Jamil daughter of Amr, a woman from Qays clan. People like Abu Bakra, Nafi' bin Harith and Shibl bin Ma'bad gave testimony and confirmed that he had committed adultery.

When a fourth witness named Ziad bin Sumayyah – or Ziad bin Abih – came to testify against Mughayra, Umar bin Khattab made him understand that he should give an implicit testimony least Mughayra should be denigrated and humiliated with punishment.

Then Umar asked Ziad about his observations: "Did you see Mughayra penetrating and withdrawing like kohl needle entering the Kohl bottle?"

"No," said Ziad.

Umar then said: "Allahu Akbar, O Mughayra, stand up and punish the witnesses." There and then Mughayra stood up and punished all the three witnesses.10 Samura bin Jundab Selling Wine

Samura bin Jundab began to sell wine during the time of Umar bin Khattab, the second caliph. When Umar heard of this, he said: "May God destroy him..."11

Mu'awiyah Selling Idols

The story of Mu'awiyah bin Abu Sufyan selling idols has been narrated in Al-Mabsut fi al-Hanafi as such: "Masruq has been quoted as having said: Mu'awiyah sent some sculptures made of copper to India."

Seeing this cargo, Masruq said: "By Allah, if I were certain that Mu'awiyah would not kill me, I would have thrown them into the sea but I am scared lest he should torture and mislead me. By Allah, I don't know what kind of a humanb being Mu'awiyah is?! He is a man whose despicable acts Shaitan has adorned to make them look beautiful to him or he is a man who has despaired of the hereafter and is now trying to enjoy this world."12

Abdur Rahman bin Umar Drinking Wine

When his father ruled Arabia as a caliph and Amr Aas was the governor of Egypt, Abu Shahma Abdur Rahman bin Umar bin Khattab drank wine in this land. Umar sent for him and he was brought from Egypt to Medina where he was punished for drinking wine. Amr Aas also flogged him for drinking wine (due to which he had fallen ill) and then put him in prison. It was due to the punishment for drinking wine that he fell ill and died in prison.13

Ignorance of Some Companions

Some of the eminent companions were in complete ignorance of the Islamic laws and even the meanings of Arabic works. They were opinionating about these laws and words without knowledge of them.

Despite the fact that the word kalalah occurs in the Quran and that the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his family, also explained its meaning to people, but as it is known, Abu Bakr did not know the meaning of this word. When asked about the meaning of the word kalalah, he said: I have my view about kalalah. If it is true, it would be by the grace of God, the One and the Unique, and if it is untrue, it has come out of me and the Shaitan and God is detached from him...14

Mu'awiyah Betraying in Sale of Commodity

Mu'awiyah bin Abu Sufyan sold goods and things for more than they actually weighed. For example, it has been reported in al-Muwatta' that Zayd bin Aslam heard Ata bin Yasar say the following: "Mu'awiyah had a container made of gold and which he used to drink water with, or he had some dinar which he sold for more than their weight.

At this time, Abu Darda said: "I heard the Prophet (S) forbid such a transaction except for when every (homogenous) commodity should be sold for exactly the same weight.

"I don't see any problem in this transaction," Mu'awiyah said.

Abu Darda replied, "If you are fair enough, you would see that I have just informed Mu'awiyah of the saying of the Messenger of Allah (S) but he gives me his own opinion. O Mu'awiyah, I will not reside in the land that you are living in."[15]

Zayd bin Arqam's Action

Zayd bin Arqam committed an act for which he repented. According to Aisha, if he did not repent for that offense, he would have lost all the divine rewards which he had earned while doing jihad and fighting alongside the Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him and his family. Some traditionists, jurisprudents and exegetes of the Holy Quran have quoted Umm Yunus that Umm Bahna, the slave woman of Umm Walad, said to Aisha, the wife of the Prophet, peace be upon him and his family: "O Mother of the Faithful, do you know Zayd bin Arqam?"

Aisha responded that she knew him.

Umm Bahna said: "I sold a male-slave for eight hundred (dirham or dinar) on credit to Zayd bin Arqam but he needed the money (which he wanted to give me for the slave). Therefore, before the due date, I bought the slave for six hundred (dirham or dinar) back from him."

Aisha then said: "What a bad transaction you have carried out. Tell Zayd that if he does not repent, he has destroyed his jihad alongside the Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him and his family."

Umm Bahna said: Can I waive him of the two hundred (dirham or dinar) and just take the six hundred?"

Aisha said: "Yes, because the Quran says:

"To whomsoever then the admonition has come from his Lord, then he desists, he shall have* (*the profits of*) *what has already passed, and his affair is in the hands of Allah."[16]

Aisha and Hafsa's Conspiracy

Aisha and Hafsa worked out a conspiracy against Zainab bint Jahsh. It has been reported in a narration as such: "The Prophet used to stay for a long while with Zainab bint Jahsh and drink honey at her house. So Hafsa and I decided that if the Prophet came to anyone of us, she should say to him, "I detect the smell of Maghafir[17] in you. Have you eaten Maghafir?'

"So the Prophet visited one of them and she said to him similarly. The Prophet said, "Never mind, I have taken some honey at the house of Zainab bint Jahsh, butI shall never drink of it anymore. Do not let anyone know about it."[18]

Closing Word on Hadith of al-Nujum

To sum it up, the noble verses of the Qur'an, the Prophetic traditions, and the books of jurisprudence and history are all witnesses to the invalidity of the Hadith of al-Nujum and denote that simply because the Apostle of Allah (S) had a sahabi in his company does not allow us to follow and emulate that sahabi; for, as you noticed, there have been hypocrites, impious, and criminals among the companions.

Therefore, the meaning of the Hadith of al-Nujum is, in itself, another reason that this hadith is fabricated and concocted by the counterfeiters, not mentioning the weakness of all the transmitters and the ways of transmission of this hadith which was described in details to the respected readers.19

Ahl al-Bayt, the Guiding Stars

It is very pertinent to mention that there are traditions narrated from the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his family in Sunni books and authentic sources. We believe in the significations of those traditions and act upon what they purport. According to us, there is no objection to such traditions. Some of those traditions are as follows:

The Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him and his family, says:

"Stars are security for the inhabitants of the heavens and my Ahl al-Bayt are security for my umma."

In another tradition, the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his family, has been quoted as having said:

"Stars are security for the inhabitants of the heavens, and if they vanish, the people of he heavens will also vanish, and my Ahl al-Bayt are security for the people on earth, and if my Ahl al-Bayt depart [*from the world*]*, the people of the earth will vanish."*20

In another beautiful saying, the Messenger of Allah (S) says:

"The stars are security for the people of the earth against drowning (*when at sea*) *and Ahl al-Bayt are a security to the people of the earth against discord. And if any tribe or* group opposes *my Ahl al-Bayt it will itself become fraught with discord and become a party to Iblis."*21

Shiites accept such beliefs and doctrines due, mainly, to the fact that they are in consonance with the verses of the Holy Quran and sayings of the Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him and his family. The infallibility of the Imams and Ahl al-Bayt, peace be upon them (i.e. Imam Ali and eleven of his noble descendants) has been proved through the Quran and Sunnah.

The family of the Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him and his household, have never had discord among themselves regarding any of the Islamic laws. They made their best effort to implement Islam's

sacred Shari'ah.

In closing, we shall repeat asking the same question and would say:

Is the issuance of such a hadith possible on the part of the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his family? Could he have said what some of the Sunni scholars claim?

We would say in response: Never, because a careful contemplation on the sayings of Sunni leaders regarding the hadith of al-Nujum as well as on its purport will clearly show that this hadith is invalid with all its wordings and sanads and referring and holding on to it is by no means appropriate.

The readers have noticed that in order for us to prove the illusiveness and invalidity of the Hadith of al-Nujum, it was attempted in this book to refer to just the most reliable resources of hadith, and historical and biographical sources of the leading Sunni scholars and their views and opinions concerning this hadith.

We pray to Allah, the Glorified, to purify our deeds and help us know and follow the genuine tradition of the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his family, as well as assist us in following those who are worthy of following and obedience.

Peace and blessings of Allah be upon our master, Muhammad, the guide, the honest and his pure family. Wal-hamdu lillahi rabbil Aalameen.

1. Chapter Aal-e Imran, verse 144.
2. Chapter Al-Tawbah, verse 101.
3. This hadith has been reported a number narrators. Muqbeli writes in Al-Ilm al-Shamikh: The tradition of division of Muslim Ummah into seventy three sects" have been narrated by different narrators. The different narrations corroborate and confirm one another in such a way that no doubt as left as to its denotation and signification. Tarikh al-Mazaheb al-Islamiyah by Muhammad Abu Zuhra, 11.
4. Sahih Bukhari, chapter on the Pond (al-Hawdh), 4/87 & 88. This and other hadiths have also been narrated in other Sunni hadith books especially the Sehah.
5. Irsha al-Fohul, 76.
6. Al-Jami al-Saghir, 2/303, letter (sh) No. 4934. Manawi says that Imam Ahmad bin Hanbal and Abu Ya'la have narrated this hadith from Abu Nafisa. As well, Ahmad bin Hanbal and Tabarani have narrated this hadith from Abu Musa. And Abu Na'eim Isfahani has narrated this hadith from Abu Bakr in Hilyat al-Awlia. Faidh al-Qadir, 4/229.
7. This is a famous story among prominent historians including Tabari, Ibn Athir, Ibn Khaldun, Masudi, Abul Fida, etc.
8. In Islam, iddah or iddat (period of waiting) is the period a woman must observe after the death of her spouse or after a divorce, during which she may not marry another man.
9. This story is also well-known to historians and it has been recorded in historical, biographical and theological books. It is considered to be one of the points of criticism and objections to Abu Bakrbin Abi Quhafa.
10. Wafiyat al-A'ayan, 6/364; Tarikh al-Tabari, 3/168 – 170, Al-Bedayah wa al-Nehayah, 7/93 & 94. As it is clear, this text is in clear conflict with the conspicuous and evident Shari'ah and Islamic laws.
11. Sahih Bukhari, 2/774 & 775, Kitab al-Boyu', chapter La-Yuzab Shuhm a-Mayyita< hadith 2110 and other books.
12. Al-Mabsut fi al-Hanafi, 24/46; Kitab al-Arbrar
13. Sharh Nahjul Balaghah, 12/104 -106; As is clear, this story in clear contrast with shari'ah texts from many aspects.
14. All exegetes and theologians have reported this saying.

15. Al-Muwatta', 2/634; Kitab al-Buyu', Baab Bay' Zahab bil fidha tabran wa 'aynan, hadith 33, vide: Sharh al-Muwatta, Suyut, 2/135 and 136.
16. Tafsir ibn Qathir, 1/335. Al-Dur al-Manthur, 1/645. This story has been reported in both of these two books in the interpretation of verse 275 of Surah al-Baqarah which forbids usury. Ibn Kathir further says that this story is famous. This story has been reported by Ibn Athir in Jami' al-Usul, Al-Marghinani in Al- Hedayah and Kashani in Badaye'.
17. Maghafir is the plural of “maghfur”. Maghfur a sticky and sweet gum from the urfut tree having an unpleasant smell.
18. This story can be found in Sehah of Ahl-e Sunnah and other hadith books.
19. A number of the scholars of hadith like Bazzaz – as pointed out earlier – ibn Qayyim and Ibn Hazm, have expressly state the invalidity of this hadith. See I'lam al-Mawqe'ayn 2/231 and 232. Silsilat al-Ahadith al-Dha'ifa wa al-Mawdhu'ah, 1/83. Ibn Hazm says, "It is impossible for the Prophet (S) to have given such a command." That is to say, it is not acceptable even to make such an assumption.
20. Zakha'er al-Uqba, 49; Is'aaf al-Ragheben (printed on the margin of Noor al-Absar), 130. In both, the tradition has been narrated on the authority of Ahmad bin Hanbal.
21. Ihya al-Mayyit, 85 as narrated by Hakim Neishabouri, Is'aaf al-Ragheben, 130. In this source, the text of

The Holy Quran

Abjad al-Ulum, Muhammad Siddiq Khan bin Hasan Qanauji Hindi.

Ajwebat a-Masail Jarullah, Sayyid Abdul Hussein Sharafuddin Ameli, Ahlul- Bayt (A.S) World Assembly, Qom, Iran, Year, 1416.

Al-Ihkam fi Usul al-Ahkam, Ali bin Muhammad Amadi, Dar al-Kitab al-Arabi, Beirut, second edition, year, 1406.

Ihya al-Mayyit be-Fadhail Ahl al-Bayt, Jalaluddin Suyuti, Dar al-Thaqalayn, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, year, 1415.

Ihya Ulum al-Din, Abu Hamed Ghazzali, Dar al-Ma'refah, Beirut, Lebanon,.

Irshad al-Fohul Ela Tahqiq al-Haqq min Ilm al-Usul, Sheikh Muhammad bin Ali Shawkani, Mustafa Halabi Publications, Cairo.

Al-Isti'ab fi Ma'refat al-Ashab, Ibn Abd al-Barr, Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, year 1415.

Usd al-Ghabah, Abu al-Hasan Ali bin Muhammad Sheibani known as Ibn Athir, Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon.

Is'af al-Raghebin, Muhammad Shafe'i Masri (printed on the margin of Noor al- Absar), Dar al-Fikr Publications, Beirut, Lebanon.

Al-Isabah fi Tamyiz al-Sahabah, Ibn Hajar Asqalani, Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, year 1415.

Adhwa Alaa al-Sunnah al-Muhammadiyah, Mahmood Abu Rayya, Dar al- Ma'aref, Egypt.

Al-I'lam, Zirkili, Dar al-Ilm lil-Malayeen, Beirut, Lebanon, Year 1997 A.D.

I'lam al-Mawqe'ayn 'an Rabbil Alameen, Ibn Qayyim al-Jawzi, Dar Ihya al- Turath al-Arabi, Beirut, Lebanon.

Al-Ansab, Sam'ani, Dar al-Fikr, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, Year 1408.

Al-Uns al-Jalil, Abdu Rahman bin Muhamamd Alimi Muqaddasi, Haideriyah Library, Najaf.

Idhah al-Maknoon, Ismail Pasha Baghdadi, Dar al-Fikr, Beirut, Lebanon.

Al-Muhit fi Tafsir al-Qur'an, Abu Hayyan Andalusi, Dar Ihaya al-Turath al- Arabi, Beirut, Lebanon.

Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehayah (Tarikh Ibn Kathir), Hafiz Abi Fada Ismail bin Kathir Dimashqi, Dar Ihya al-Turath al-Arabi, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, Year 1408.

Al-Badr al-Tali', Shawkani, Dar al-Ma'refah, Beirut, Lebanon.

Bughyat al-Wu'at fi Tabaqat al-Lughawiyeen wa al-Nohat, Jalaluddin Suyuti.

Taj al-Aroos, Zubaidi, Dar Maktabat al-Hayat, Beirut, Lebanon.

Tarikh Isfahan (Zikr Akhbar Isfahan), Abu Nu'aym Ahmad bin Abdullah Isfahani, Brail Publications, Year 1934 A.D.

Tarikh al-Tabari, Salman bin Ahmad bin Ayyub Lakhmi Tabari, Urumiyah Bookstall Publications, Qom, Iran.

Tarikh Baghdad (History of Baghad), Khatib Baghdadi, Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, Year 1417.

Tatimmat al-Mukhtasar fi Akhbar al-Bashar Umar bin Wardi, Najaf, Iraq.

Tazkerat al-Huffaz, Zahabi, Dar Ihya al-Turath al-Arabi, Beirut, Lebanon.

Tazkerat al-Mawdhu'at, Muhammad Tahir bi Ali Hindi, Al-Qayyemah Library, first edition, Year 1343.

Tafsir Ibn Kathir (Tafsir al-Qur'an al-Azim), Ibn Kathir, Dar al-Ma'refah, Beirut, Lebanon, third edition, Year 1409.

Tafsir al-Kashshaf, Zamakhshari, Mustafa Babi Halabi Printing and Publication Company, Egypt, 1385.

Al-Taghrir wa al-Tahbir fi Sharh al-Tahrir, Muhammad bin Muhammad Halabi better known as Ibn Amir al-Haj, Dar al-Fikr Publications, Beirut, Lebanon.

Al-Taysir fi Sharh al-Tahrir, Muhammad Amin known as Amir Padshah Hanafi.

Al-Jami' al-Saghir, Jalaluddin Suyuti, Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, Year 1410.

Jami' Bayan al-Ilm wa Fadhlehi, Ibn Abd al-Barr, Dar Ibn al-Jawzi, Saudi Arabia, second edition, Year 1416.

Al-Jawaher al-Mudhe'ah fi Tabaqat al-Hanafiyah, Abu Muhammad, Abdul Qadir bin Muhammad Qarashi Hanafi.

Husn al-Muhadharah, Jalaluddin Suyuti, Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, Year 1418.

Husul al-Ma'mool min Ilm al-Usul, Muhammad Siddiq Khan Qanauji Hindi.

Khulasat al-Athar fi A'ayan al-Qarn al-Hadi Ashar, Muhammad Amin bin Fadhlullah Muhebbi Hanafi, Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyah, first edition, Year 1427.

Al-Dur al-Laqit min al-Bahr al-Muhit, Taj al-Din Ibn Maktoom Qaysi (printed on the margin of al-Bahr al-Muhit).

Al-Dur al-Manthur fi al-Tafsir al-Ma'thur, Jalaluddin Suyuti, Dar al-Kotob al- Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, Year 1421.

Al-Darajat al-Rafi'ah fi al-Tabaqat al-Shi'ah, Sadr al-Din Sayyid Ali Khan Madani Shirazi, Al-Wafa Institute, Beirut, Lebanon.

Al-Durar al-Kaminah fi A'ayan al-Me'ah al-Thaminah, Ibn Hajar Asqalani, Dar al-Jayl, Beirut, Lebanon, Year 1414.

Zakhayir al-'Uqba, Muhib al-Din Tabari, Al-Sahabah Library, Jeddah, Al- Sharqiyah, Al-Tabe'in Library, Cairo, Egypt, first edition, Year 1415.

Al-Re'ayah Lahal al-Bedayah, Sheikh Zainuddin bin Ali Al-Ameli known as Shahid Thani (the Second Martyr), may Allah bless him.

Reyhanat al-Albaa, Ahmad bin Muhammad bin Umar Khafaji Masri.

Sabhat al-Marjan fi Ulama Hindustan, al-Sayyid Ghulam Ali Azad Belkerami.

Silsilat al-Ahadith al-Dha'ifah wa al-Mawdhu'ah, Muhammad bin Tahir Nasir al- Din Albani.

Shazarat al-Zahab, Ibn Imad, Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon.

Sharh al-Shifa, Sheikh Shahab al-Din Khafaji Masri Hanafi.

Sharh al-Mukhtasar fi al-Usul, Ibn Hajib, first edition, Year 1316.

Sharh al-Maqasid, Taftazani, Sharif Razi Publications, Qom, Iran, first edition, Year 1409.

Sharh Nahj al-Balaghah, Ibn Abil-Hadid, Mu'atazili, Dar Ihya al-Turath al- Arabi, Beirut, Lebanon, second edition, Year 1387.

Sheik al-Mudheirah, Mahmood Aburiyah Masri, Sharif Razi Publications, Qom, Year 1414.

Sahih Bukhari, Bukhari, Dar Ibn Kathir, Damash, Yammamah, fifth edition, Year 1414 and Dar al-Fikr, Beirut, Year 1401.

Al-Dhaw' al-Lami' li Ahl al-Qar al-Tasi', Shams al-Din Muhammad bin Abdur Rahman Sakhawi, Maktabat al-Hayat Publications, Beirut, Lebanon.

Tabaqat al-Shafe'iyah, Osnowa, Dar al-Ulum, Saudi Arabia, Riyadh, Year 1401.

Tabaqat al-Qurra', Hafiz Shams al-Din Muhammad bin Jazri, Cairo, Egypt, Year 1351.

Al-'Ibar fi Khabar min Ghabar, Shams al-Muhammad bin Ahmad bin Uthman Zahabi, Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon.

Al-'Ilal al-Mutanahiyah fi al-Ahadith al-Wahiyah, Ibn Jawzi, Dar al-Kotob al- Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, Year 1403.

Al-Ilm al-Shamikh, Saleh bin Mahdi Muqbeli.

Fawat al-Wafiyat, Muhammad bin Shakir Katbi, Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 2000 A.D.

Faid al-Qadir fi Sharh Jami' al-Saghir, Abdur Rauf Manawi, Dar al-Kotob al- Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, Year 1415.

Al-Qamus al-Muhit, Feiruzabadi, Dar Ihya al-Turath al-Arabi Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, Year 1412.

Qanun al-Mawdhu'at, Muhammad bin Tahir bin Ali Hindi Fatani (printed with Tadhkerat al-Mawdhu'at).

Al-Kaf al-Shaf fi Takhrij Ahadith al-Kashshaf, Ahmad bin Ali bin Hajar Asqalani (printed with al-Kashaf), Egypt.

Kashf al-Zunun, Haji Khalifah, Dar al-Fikr, Beirut, Lebanon, Year, 1414.

Al-Kefayah fi Ilm al-Rewayah, Khatib Baghdadi, Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, Year 1409.

Kanz al-Ummal, Muttaqi Hindi, Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, Year 1419.

Al-Lubab fi Tahzib al-Ansab, Izzuddin Ibn Athir Jazri, Dar Sader, Beirut, Lebanon.

Lisan al-Mizan, Ibn Hajar, Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, Year 1416.

Al-Mabsut fi al-Fiqh al-Hanafi, Sarakhsi, Dar al-Ma'refah, Beirut, Lebanon, Year 1406.

Al-Mukhtasar (Bayan al-Mukhtasar), Ibn Hajib, Markaz Ihya al-Turath al-Islami, Makkah al-Mukarramah, Saudi Arabia.

Al-Mukhtasar fi Akhbar al-Bashar, Imad al-Din Ismail bin Abil Fada, Dar Abdul Latif, Egypt.

Mer'at al-Jenan, Yafe'i, Dar al-Kitab al-Islami, Cairo, Egypt, Year 1413.

Al-Merqat fi Sharh al-Mishkat, Mulla Ali Qari, Dar al-Fikr, Beirut, Lebanon, Year 1414.

Musnad of Ahmad bin Hanbal, Ahmad bn Hanbal Sheibani, Beirut, Lebanon, third edition, Year 1415.

Al-Misbah al-Munir, Ahmad bin Muhammad bin Ali al-Muqri al-Fayumi, Al- Ilmiyah Library, Beirut, Lebanon.

Mu'jam al-Odaba, Yaqut Hamudi, Dar al-Ma'moon, Egypt.

Al-Mughni 'An Haml al-Asfar, Abdur Rahim bin Hussein al-Iraqi.

Al-Mughni fi al-Dhu'afa, Zahabi, Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, Year 1418.

Mufakehat al-Khillan, Ibn Mu'tamed Ibrahim Ibn Muhammad Dimashqi Shafi'ei.

Al-Mufradat fi Gharib al-Qur'an, Raghib Isfahani, Dar al-Qalam, Damascus, Year 1412.

Al-Maqasid al-Hasanah fi Bayan Kathir min al-Ahadith al-Mushtaherah Alaa al- Alsenah, Sakhawi, Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, Year 1424.

Miqbas al-Hidayah, Sheikh Abdullah Mamqani (may Allah bless him).

Muntakhab Kanz al-Ummal, Muttaqi Hindi.

Al-Mawdhu'at, Ibn Jawzi, Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, Year 1415.

Al-Mawdhu'at al-Kobra, Mulla Ali Qari, Islamic Library, Beirut, Lebanon, second edition, Year 1406.

Al-Muwatta', Malik bin Anas, Dar Ihya al-Turath Al-Arabi, Beirut, Lebanon, Year 1406.

Mizan al-I'tidal, Zahabi, Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, Year 1416.

Al-Nujum al-Zaherah fi Muluk Masr wa al-Qahira, Yusuf bin Taghri Atabaki, Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah,

Cairo.

Al-Nasaih al-Kafiyah le-Man Yatawalla Mu'awiyah, Muhammad bin Aqil Alawi, Dar al-Thaqafah, Qom, Iran, Year 1412.

Nafh al-Tayyib Ma'a Ghusn Al-Andalus al-Ratib, Hafiz Sheikh Ahmad bin Muhammad Maqqari Talmasani, Dar Sadir, Beirut, Lebanon.

Noor al-Absar, Momeen Shablanji, Dar al-Fikr, Beirut.

Al-Noor al-Safir, Shams al-Din Abdul Qadir Eidrusi.

Al-Nehayah fi Gharib al-Hadith, Ibn Athir, Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, Year 1418.

Al-Wafi bil Wafiyat, Safdi, Dar Ihya al-Turath, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, year 1420.

Wafiyat al-A'yan, Shams al-Din Ahmad bin Muhammad bin Khalaqan, Dar Sadir, Beirut Lebanon.

Al-Hedayah, Burhan al-Din Ali bin Abu Bakr Marghinani.

Hadiyat al-Arefeen, Ismail Pasha Baghdadi, Dar Ihya al-Turath al-Arabi, Beirut, Lebanon.

Source URL: https://www.al-islam.org/truth-about-companions-sayyid-ali-al-husayni-al-milani

Links

[1] https://www.al-islam.org/user/login?destination=node/40430%23comment-form
[2] https://www.al-islam.org/user/register?destination=node/40430%23comment-form
[3] https://www.al-islam.org/person/sayyid-ali-al-husayni-al-milani
[4] https://www.al-islam.org/person/jawid-akbari
[5] https://www.al-islam.org/library/sunni-shia
[6] https://www.al-islam.org/library/hadith-collections
[7] https://www.al-islam.org/tags/companions
[8] https://www.al-islam.org/tags/hadith-al-nujum
[9] https://www.al-islam.org/feature/debates-discussions
[10] https://www.al-islam.org/feature/resources-further-research
[11] https://www.al-islam.org/feature/responses-misconceptions
[12] https://www.al-islam.org/feature/shia-beliefs-explained